Bridging the Gap Together

A collaborative approach to addressing the gender pay gap in Wales.

Written by Yvonne Griffith-Jones of Chwarae Teg on behalf of the Cytgord Development Partnership
Introduction

Who are we?

This book has been researched, recorded and compiled by the Cytgord Development Partnership led by Chwarae Teg. Cytgord is the Welsh word for ‘harmony’. The partnership was established under the EQUAL programme of European funding in Wales back in October 2004. Members of the partnership included: Chwarae Teg; the Equal Opportunities Commission; Wales TUC Cymru; University of Wales, Bangor; the Welsh Development Agency (which became the Welsh Assembly Government’s Department of Enterprise Innovation and Networks in 2006), and the Fawcett Society.

This collaborative approach reflects 18 months of work including developing the partnership, deciding on its role and functions and culminating in the joint research project recorded on the following pages. Even though the project is now completed, the partnership will continue to work together towards eliminating the gender pay gap in Wales.

What is this book for?

This handbook aims to help and broaden the understanding amongst employers, training providers, educators, organisations and individuals in Wales of the gender pay gap. The evidence presented in the book is hoped to raise better awareness of the implications and the impact of the gender pay gap on nearly everyone in Wales. It aims to reflect on what has been achieved in the past, paint a picture of the current situation and offer ideas and recommendations on the way forward. The book also demonstrates the good practice already being undertaken, the innovative approaches outside of Wales proving to be a success and also offers some practical guidance to those who can make a difference.

Who is this book for?

This book is aimed primarily at those who have an active role to play in closing the gender pay gap in Wales. They include:

- Employers
- Education and training providers
• Policy makers

However, it is also aimed at women and lone parents who would like to gain a better understanding of the issue, and would like to make informed choices about their career path and earning potential. Finally, it is for those who would like to know more about the gender pay gap issue in Wales.

Why has it been produced?

Even after 30 years of equal pay legislation there is still a gender pay gap in Wales. There are many reasons for this gap, not just because some women are paid less than men for doing the same job or are sometimes passed up for promotion or pay awards. This book explores some of those reasons in more detail, as we wanted to ascertain whether the reasons had changed over the years; whether they were indigenous to Wales; and whether they were attitudinal, linked to lack of awareness, discrimination or policy and practice.

We also wanted to record the history and experience of some of the key organisations involved in campaigning and implementing activities to address the pay gap over the years, and to bring together other known research as well as new evidence in one publication to give us a better picture of the current situation.

Finally, we were eager to record some firm recommendations on the way forward to work towards closing the gender pay gap in Wales.

How is the book structured?

First it sets the scene, exploring evidence of demographic trends and outlining current policy. It also looks at the history and the experience of the gender pay gap for key organisations in Wales over the past 10 – 15 years. It then moves on to examine the reasons for the gender pay gap more closely and considers some of the key factors and barriers in particular for women, and lone parents. The later sections look at the European context, including legislative directives, progress and models of good practice in other countries, and focuses on what gender and equality mainstreaming means and how positive action and pro-active approaches compliment progress in this area by examining examples and models of good practice.

Finally, we summaries the key issues and findings and present recommendations on the way forward. Each section deals with a number of
important issues and factors, each being dealt with in a three part format: first, the evidence from various sources, followed by an examination of the implications and impact of certain factors on the gender pay gap, and finally we add examples of work in progress to illustrate the current activities in Wales being taken forward to address the issues.

Using this book

We hope that this book will be a source of information, enlightenment and guidance for those who are affected, involved and interested in the gender pay gap in Wales. Some of the barriers to closing the pay gap are attitudinal and we hope to raise awareness of the importance and significance of addressing this issue. We also hope that this book will help many readers to take pro-active approaches and be actively involved in our campaign to close the pay gap.

How we did the work

Bearing in mind the huge range of national and European literature available on different aspects of this subject, and the limited time available to undertake this work, we decided to rely mainly on a desk research of the published literature and research documents already produced. This was generally restricted to work published and research undertaken within the last five years, although the history and experience chapter goes back as far as 15 years. In addition we conducted a survey to ascertain the current situation amongst employers, education and training providers, equality organisations, policy makers and individual women and lone parents across Wales.

Other sources of information came from the project’s European partners, through attendance at European conferences and through former links established due to Chwarae Teg’s involvement in the European Structural Funds Programmes.

Updating the research

The CYTGORD research project is now complete. However, the CYTGORD partnership will continue to strive towards closing the gender pay gap in Wales. Research evidence always changes and we would be delighted to hear of fresh evidence to support (or contradict) our assertions, any new policy interventions and new examples of good practice which illustrates the points made.
The current context

What is the gender pay gap?

The gender pay gap refers to the difference in average hourly earnings of men and women in Wales.

The CYTGORD Development Partnership responsible for this research is committed to reducing the gap between men’s and women's earnings in Wales, and making sure that women's talents are properly used and rewarded.

Across Wales the hourly wages of a woman who is in full-time employment are around 82% of a full-time male worker. In other words the hourly gender pay gap between women and men is 12%, this increases to 31% for women working part-time and the weekly gap is around 22%. These lower earnings leave women at greater risk of falling below the poverty line and of being worse off financially including in retirement. Women face an unfair disadvantage and the Welsh economy is missing out on fulfilling it’s full potential in productivity and output, even after 30 years of sex equality legislation.

This means that women working full time are currently paid, on average, 87% of men’s hourly pay. Since 1975, when the Equal Pay Act came into effect, the full-time pay gap has closed considerably, from 29.5% to 19.8% in 1997 and from 21.2% in 1998 to 17.1% in 2005, based on full time working. (There is discontinuity between 1997 and 1998 due to a difference in the methodology of data collection). Therefore, the full-time gender pay gap has closed from 17.4% in 1998 to 12% in 2006.¹

However, data collected in 2000 showed that over the course of a woman’s life the pay gap will cost her £250,000 and a further £140,000 if she has children.

Why is there a gender pay gap in Wales, and what evidence do we have?

Equal pay for men and women is not just about wages and salaries. There are many reasons for the gender pay gap in Wales these include:

¹ Statistics provided by Equal Opportunities Commission
• Occupational segregation – this means the type of jobs done by women and men. Women’s employment in Wales is still highly concentrated in certain occupations that pay less than occupations dominated by men. According to the 2001 Census\(^2\) women in Wales still dominate personal support services (84%); administrative and secretarial (78%) and customer services occupations (71%). The other female dominated sector in Wales is the social care sector - which is 80% female out of 70,000 workers.\(^3\)

• ‘The Glass Ceiling Effect’ - women in Wales are still under-represented in the higher paid jobs within occupations. There are fewer women then men in management and leadership positions in Wales. The Equal Opportunities Commission publication *Who Runs Wales 2006* reflected that only 2 out of 22 local authorities have a female Chief Executive and only 22% of local councillors are women. Only 20% of hospital consultants are women.

• Contractual segregation – this means the hours that men and women work per week. Women make up the majority of part-time workers in Wales. Part-time work also tends to be concentrated in less well-paid occupations. Nearly half (46%) of all women who work are part-time compared to one in ten men.\(^4\)

• Discrimination - there are women in Wales who are still paid less than their male counterparts for doing exactly the same job of equal value. This is even 30 years after the Equal Pay Act came into force. There are also instances of women being treated less favourably than men on other grounds, such as pregnancy.

• Work Life Balance – women still make up the majority of people who are the primary carers of children or dependent adults in Wales. Balancing caring responsibilities with work need not be difficult, but is often the case for women who are directly or indirectly discriminated against in the workplace because of the lack of flexible policies and practices. Women taking career breaks due to a caring responsibility also risk receiving less pension at retirement.

There are also some other factors which contribute to the gender pay gap in Wales, which we will be examining more closely in the main part of this book.

\(^2\) 2001 Census Key Statistics for Local Authorities in England and Wales  
\(^3\) The Skills Foresight Plan for the Social Care Sector in Wales – April 2003, Care Council Wales  
\(^4\) Facts about Women and Men in Wales – 2005, Equal Opportunities Commission
Why is it important to address the gender pay gap in Wales?

Apart from ensuring equality in our society from a social justice and legal perspective, addressing the gender pay gap will have a significant impact on the Welsh economy, on poverty and on individuals and families throughout Wales. The consequences of the pay gap are far-reaching. For individual women, they can include personal poverty and social exclusion, particularly for single parents. These factors in turn can have implications for child poverty. The pay gap also inhibits women’s ability to build up adequate occupational pensions to guard against poverty in later life. It restricts the resources available to them for investment in training and life-long learning, and it reduces their motivation. Therefore the impact of addressing the gender pay gap is extensive.

The benefits are huge for employers in the areas of:
- recruitment, retention and productivity;

for education and training providers through:
- trainee numbers, high achiever outcomes and completers;

for policy makers in:
- promoting inclusion and delivering outcomes

and for individuals in:
- providing financial independence through opportunity and choice.

Demographic trends

According to projections older people will markedly increase in numbers and proportion in the UK over the next 25 years. Decreasing birth rates, improved infant survival rates, advancement in medical science and increased longevity means more older people and fewer younger people\(^5\). This could lead to a significant increase in the number of people caring for dependent adults and thus increasing the numbers of employees with a caring responsibility in Wales over the coming years.

In addition, with the introduction of the employment regulation on age discrimination coming into force at the end of 2006 there will be further opportunities for people over the age of 65 to continue working. In 1961 there were almost four people of working age to support each pensioner. By 2040

\(^5\) Government Actuary’s Department, GAD, 2002
there will be two. According to projections there will be a 30% increase in the proportion of women over 55 by 2021. Whilst there is now a greater emphasis on helping women to save, many will continue to suffer the effects of lower wages, and the effects of career breaks and insufficient pension provision.

As the cost of living is set to increase more women may chose to become economically active and the demand on childcare provision will increase. Forecasts predict that over 70% of mothers with children under five will remain in work by the year 2010. Women’s family lives will continue to transform but the emotional importance of family will remain central to their lives. Without adequate and accessible provision this will continue to be one of the main barriers to women’s participation in the labour market in Wales 15 years after the first childcare initiatives were established to address the issue.

Despite the stereotype of the ‘harassed’ father “escaping” to the office, twice as many working mothers in Wales (30%) compared to (16%) of working fathers admitted that going out to work gave them valuable time away from family life, according to research done by Marketing to Families in September 2005.

Research undertaken by the Women’s National Commission in the year 2000\(^6\) reported that the biggest drivers for women in the 21\(^{st}\) century will be higher levels of education and increased earnings. Unless action is taken now to redress the balance women who are poor, lack education, or come from ethnic minority groups will continue to be relatively vulnerable and disadvantaged.

Single parents currently head a quarter of families with children. Approximately 9% of single parents in Wales are men.\(^7\) With the successful introduction of positive action approaches like New Deal for Lone Parents, 14,700 lone parents in Wales have gained employment since it’s launch in 1998. Chwarae Teg’s Lone Parent Venture assisted 282 male and female lone parents throughout Wales to start their own business between 2002 – 2006.

In the coming years we need to harness women’s and lone parents potential as they enter, return or remain in the labour market, and we need to prepare for these demographic changes to ensure that all opportunities are maximised to close the gender pay gap in Wales.

\(^7\) Lone Parent Study Report, Chwarae Teg, 1999
Economic trends

The Welsh economy is undergoing a major change. Although manufacturing remains relatively an important sector, a new knowledge driven economy is growing rapidly with a greater emphasis on Research & Development and links with academic establishments.

Significant public and private investment is supporting this change. Wales already has a sophisticated high technology fibre optic network to deliver high-speed broadband links to all but the most remote parts of the country, and Technium centres are being developed as focal points for research and development. Other important sectors include aerospace, automotive and bio-technology.

Whilst industry activity tends to be concentrated in the south and the south east and north east of Wales, agriculture and tourism underpin the economy of the rural areas.

The majority of employers in Wales are small to medium sized enterprises, employing less than 250 staff. These companies account for approximately 96% of all Welsh employers, whereas the public sector include some of the largest employers in the country including the health trusts, and national and local government.

According to the most recent Local Labour Force Survey if the skills gaps in certain industries are set to continue it will result in a resource crisis for many employers particularly small employers who rely on an already limited pool of the skilled workforce. This is particularly pertinent as 96% of all employers in Wales employ less than 250 people.

Policy Context

Gender equality actually impacts on all policies and planning processes throughout every aspect of society. However, there are areas where it is particularly relevant to ensure gender equality:

- economic development
- education, lifelong learning and skills development
- local regeneration
- social care
- and at European level
The National Assembly for Wales published its economic development strategy in November 2005, *Wales: A Vibrant Economy*, which refers to the fact that ‘ensuring equality of opportunity and promoting openness, partnership and participation are central values to the vision of a sustainable Wales’. The National Assembly for Wales’s strategy for Education and Lifelong learning, *Wales: A Learning Country* includes measures which aim to provide better life chances to people in Wales. The Strategy also refers to the National Assembly for Wales’s commitment to tackling gender imbalances and testing the process of ‘engendering’ budgets within education and training bodies. *Making the Connections* is the Welsh Assembly Government’s vision of a prosperous, sustainable, bi-lingual, healthier and better-educated Wales. One of the four main principles of this vision includes equality and social justice – where every person will have the opportunity to contribute, and where ‘…we will reach out to those hardest to reach.’

The *Entrepreneurship Action Plan for Wales* was compiled by a group of organisations in the private and public sectors, and sets out the objective of creating businesses owned by under-represented groups including women. It also includes ideas for positive action and pro-active approaches to women’s entrepreneurial activity.

The National Assembly for Wales’s *Childcare Action Plan* sets out the government’s plans for ensuring a comprehensive childcare service for parents in Wales and the *Carers Strategy in Wales – Implementation Plan* looks to address the carers of dependent adults including their participation in the labour market.

All the above strategy documents highlight the business case for equality and diversity, the important role that women can play in filling the skills gaps in certain industries and the overall economic impact and benefits to Wales of ensuring gender equality in education, training and employment.

**European policy context**

It is also important to consider gender equality in the context of European policy as policies developed at this level have a direct impact on how policies, strategies and funding programmes are determined in Wales. The principle of equal treatment of women and men was enshrined in the 1957 *Treaty of Rome*. This was later underlined by a firm commitment written into the 1997 *Amsterdam Treaty*, alongside a stronger legal base for positive action for equal treatment of women and men. The treaty was ratified in 1999.
and formed the basis of the equality requirements for the *EU Structural Funds Programmes in Wales from 2000 - 2006*.

In March 2000, the EU Heads of States and Governments agreed to make the EU "the most competitive and dynamic knowledge-driven economy by 2010". This resulted in *The Lisbon Agenda* being adopted by all member states. Although some progress has been made on innovating Europe's economy, there is growing concern that the reform process is not going fast enough and that the ambitious economic targets will not be reached.

**Life stages of women and men**

The early sixties saw the dawn of feminism in the USA and the UK with the publication of American author Betty Friedan’s: *A Feminine Mystique* in 1963, followed by many women joining the movement to campaign for equality, fair treatment and rights for women in every aspect of life. Many say that the feminist movement was the catalyst for change that saw equality law introduced and a significant number of women entering the labour market for the first time since the second world war - when women undertook the majority of jobs whilst men were at war, and were then relegated to unemployment when they returned.

Gender stereotyping that blighted generations in the sixties and seventies enslaved both sexes: men into being the life-long breadwinners, denied time with their children, and women into lives rich with frustrated ambitions. Feminism back then in essence was also to ensure equality for all.

Interestingly, according to research undertaken by Womankind Worldwide in March 2006 to coincide with International Women's Day, only 29% of women now define themselves as feminists. Many women today see feminism as old fashioned and think more in terms of equality and equal opportunities for all.

According to UK Government research carried out by the Economic and Social Research Council more women than ever are going out to work through necessity. For many the decision is purely economic, triggered by the end of tax breaks for married couples and the availability of higher mortgages for dual-income couples. For others it is an opportunity to harness unused talent and fulfil personal ambitions.

Many of the women interviewed in the course of the research felt that equality has been achieved. An Equal Opportunities Commission study suggested that most women in the UK felt that they had achieved equality with men. However, even though some of these feelings were reflected in Wales, and
the fact that over 50% of the current Welsh workforce are women - a gender pay still exists.

Traditionally the life cycles of women and men have been very different. Girls at school if not particularly academic were encouraged to chose subjects suitable for their gender such as typing, cooking and sewing. Boys were also encouraged to chose subjects such as science, woodwork and metalwork, ultimately leading them to follow traditionally gendered career paths and vocations. Whilst the same may not be said about schools in Wales today the pattern of gender stereotyping in education, training and employment is still very much in evidence.

Women have also always been the primary carers of children and dependent adults. Historically women have stayed at home to care for the children and be responsible for general housekeeping, while the men went out to work. Today the picture is slightly different with 55% of mothers of children under five years old having full or part-time jobs and mothers of older children even more likely to work.

Today, men are playing a more active role in caring for children and it seems likely that, in many families, both men and women will want to share work and care in a more equal way.

Whilst the debate on mothers at home Vs working mothers rages on, this research focuses on the pay gap that exists for those women who have to return to work for financial reasons and those who chose to work for financial independence and personal fulfilment. The issues explored are whether they are treated equally and fairly on their path from entering the labour market, through training and ultimately into employment.
The Law

Discrimination on the grounds of gender in employment, education and training in Wales is not only unjust and unfair but is also unlawful.

In the UK discrimination law is made up of different acts and regulations, each outlawing less favourable treatment on a specific ground such as gender.

Current legislation

The current legislation to tackle sex discrimination in employment and training is:

- The Equal Pay Act 1970
- The Sex Discrimination Act 1975

In addition, other relevant legislation includes:

- The Carers (Equal Opportunities) Act 2004
- The Employment Regulations 2003 – The Right to Request Flexible Working

The aim of the Sex Discrimination Act 1975 is to outlaw discrimination on the grounds of sex and marital status in employment, education and the provision of goods and services. The Act applies equally to women and men, but because women are more likely to suffer discrimination than men most legal cases taken forward are on behalf of women.

The Equal Pay Act 1970 is not straightforward, and despite recent amendments by the Government to streamline procedures for equal value cases, pursuing a remedy under the Equal Pay Act remains a complex process. The Act implies an equality clause into a person’s contract of employment if they can show that they are being paid less than a person of the opposite sex in a circumstance where both are doing like work, work rated as equivalent or work of equal value.

The law is relevant to large and small employers and all education and training providers.

In order to ensure that these Acts were implemented and that advice and support was provided to individuals being discriminated against, the Equal
Opportunities Commission was established. In 2007 the Equal Opportunities Commission will be abolished and replaced with a new Commission for Equality and Human Rights.

The new Commission will also include the other specialist commissions (Disability Rights Commission and the Commission for Racial Equality). Together they will form a single body to represent equality and human rights issues in Wales. Whilst in principle this could be an effective way of ensuring better joint approaches and ensure quality of advice services, it is important that specialist advice, support services and equality campaigns currently offered by the individual commissions is not lost in such a large establishment.

Problems with the current legislation

Research by the UK Equal Pay Task Force⁸ reporting to the Equal Opportunities Commission in 2001 recommended that substantial changes were needed to the equality legislation if there was to be real progress in eliminating the pay gap. Today there is general agreement that the legislation is cumbersome and time-consuming. One recommendation is that the Equal Pay Act be amended to require that all employers carry out regular equal pay reviews. However, it remains the case that employers generally don’t have to undertake equal pay reviews as part of the law.

Other issues include the fact that 62% of small businesses in Wales think they do not have a problem with discrimination in the workplace. In addition individuals and legal experts alike think that the lengthy and complex process is too time consuming, with some cases taking up to 5 years to be resolved. Lack of resources to help individuals to take cases forward is also a barrier, resulting in many women deciding not to take the case any further. Individuals also generally feel that even though the Equal Opportunities Commission is currently able to help and support women there is concern about the level of advice and assistance that will be available once the new single commission body comes into force in 2007.

Work in progress

The UK government is currently conducting a discrimination law review. This review aims to address long-held concerns about inconsistencies in the current anti-discrimination legislative framework. It is expected that this review will lead to a simpler, fairer legal framework that fits the needs of the

---

21st century. It will consider more ‘user friendly’ regulation principles. The review outcomes will be presented to the Prime Minister in the summer of 2006, by making practical recommendations for change.

Recommendations for legal reform

✓ the need for discrimination cases on the basis of equal pay to be determined only by tribunal chairpersons and members who have been specifically trained and have necessary expertise

✓ rule-changes to allow trade unions and the Equal Opportunities Commission/CEHR to bring claims on behalf of groups of employees

✓ Proper timetabling and disposal of issues to avoid long delays in cases being dealt with

New legislation

_The Gender Equality Duty_

A new Gender Equality Duty will come into force in 2007. This means that employers and service providers in the public sector will have to actively demonstrate how they will promote gender equality. By challenging the wider causes of inequality the gender equality duty has the potential to address some of the most intractable forms of inequality between women and men. It is also hoped that it will help to deliver more responsive and efficient public services. It’s success will be measured - hopefully – by change on the ground in the lives of women and men, rather than by action plans or strategic documents.

However, public service employers need clear guidance on the steps they are expected to take to tackle unequal pay if the UK Government is to meet its aim of closing the gender pay gap within a generation.

The new Duty means that employers will be expected to:

- conduct equal pay reviews
- undertake gender assessments of policy and practice (gender impact assessments)
- implement work life balance policies
Some public authorities will have to comply with ‘specific duties’ set out in regulations. The specific tasks are not yet known, but the Equal Opportunities Commission is campaigning for these specific duties to include addressing the gender pay gap.

*The Work and Families Bill 2005*

This is currently going through parliament and is at a consultation phase. If implemented it will come into force in April 2007.

Maternity Leave:

The government have proposed a Bill to extend maternity and adoption leave and pay. The Bill contains powers to extend the maximum entitlement to these benefits to a year (the government will extend the period to nine months from April 2007). This means that:

- Removing the length of service requirement for additional maternity leave so all employed mothers are able to take up to one year off work
- Extend notice periods from 28 days to two months for women returning to work earlier or later than originally planned
- Help employers and employees benefit from improved communication during maternity leave making it easier for employers and employees to maintain reasonable contact during leave.

It is estimated that around 400,000 women in the UK will benefit from the changes.

Paternity Leave:

The Bill also intends to provide employed fathers with an entitlement of up to a further 26 weeks leave (in addition to the current entitlement to Paternity Leave and unpaid Parental Leave).

This means that after the first 6 months of maternity the father will then be able to take additional paternity leave if the mother has returned to work. The father will also be able to receive additional paternity pay if the mother has returned to work was eligible to SMP or MA. At present it has not been decided on the amount of time a father must have been employed before he can be entitled to additional paternity leave. This will come into force from April 2007.
Flexible working for carers:

In addition the Bill will also make it possible for carers of dependent adults to request flexible working. There is no decision as yet about when this will be introduced. Consultation is still going on in June 2006.

This could make a significant difference to some of the 350,000 + carers in Wales or who are considering giving up work altogether because of lack of flexibility.

Help for employers:

Part of the Bill also looks at providing support for employers to implement the changes. This includes:

- Targeted guidance to make employers more aware of their responsibilities
- Clarifying that employers may make reasonable contact with employees on maternity/paternity leave
- Enhance the HMRC Employer’s Helpline so that it can calculate SMP etc and dates payable quickly and easily.

Employers have responded to the Work and Families Bill by highlighting that there will be little in the way of increased employer support for these employee benefits.

The CBI in an article featured in Business Voice magazine supported the government proposals outlined in its consultation document earlier in 2005, subject to the condition that significant support for employers would be forthcoming.

A more welcome element of the Bill is the decision to extend the right to flexible working to those employees with caring responsibilities. The right for parents has been very successful since it’s introduction in April 2003 with 90 per cent of requests in the UK being accommodated by employers according to the latest CBI/Pertemps Employment Trends Survey.
Employment Equality Regulations 2006 (Age)

In October 2006 legislation will come into force to outlaw discrimination based on age in everything to do with training and employment. The regulations cover people of all ages, both old and young. The new legislation will:

- cover all workers including those who are self-employed, contract workers, public office holders, the police and members of trade organisations.

- Remove the upper age limits for claiming unfair dismissal and replace the current redundancy age. This means that all employees including those over 65 will be entitled to statutory redundancy pay if the reason for their dismissal is redundancy.

- The national retirement age of 65 years will be introduced for men and women making compulsory retirement below age 65 unlawful (unless it can be justified). This is to be reviewed in 2011. At the moment there is no national retirement age. There is a state pension age (60 for women and 65 for men) at which you can draw your state pension, but employees do not have to retire at this age. This also means that all employees will have the right to request to work beyond the default retirement age of 65 yrs or any retirement age set by the company. All employers will have a duty to consider a request from an employee to work beyond the age of 65 years.

The establishment of the UK Government’s Women and Work Commission in October 2004 was to look at why after 30 years of equal pay legislation women were still being paid less than men. Their report, published in February 2006 *Shaping a Fairer Future* made reference to the Discrimination Law Review, which will address long-held concerns about inconsistencies in the current equality law and legislative framework. It is hoped that this review will work towards developing a simpler, fairer legal framework that fits the needs of 21st century UK. This most certainly will impact on the gender pay gap issue in Wales in relation to employment, education and training. For more information on the Women and Work Commission and its research please see section 2.

The CYTGORD Development Partnership also calls for a review of the current gender equality and equal pay legislation to ensure that the gender pay gap is eliminated in Wales.

---

9 *Shaping a Fairer Future* – Women and Work Commission, Presented to Prime Minister February 2006
Chapter 1
The Development Partnership’s history and experience

Chwarae Teg

Chwarae Teg was established in 1991, initially as a research project into the gender pay gap in Wales and was funded by a number of co-sponsors. Consequently, the organisation was formally launched in South Wales in 1991 and in North Wales in 1992.

The initial research findings demonstrated that the main barriers to women’s economic activity in Wales at the time were: childcare, travel, and gender stereotyping. To celebrate the organisation’s tenth birthday in 2001 the same research was commissioned for comparative purposes and to ascertain the level of progress made in ten years. Findings of the later research again demonstrated that childcare, travel and stereotyping were amongst the main barriers for women and employment in Wales, with the addition of ill-health.

During it’s existence the organisation has promoted women’s economic activity through focusing on 4 strategic key areas of:

- employment
- education and Lifelong Learning
- enterprise
- public Policy

Chwarae Teg’s strategic work includes close collaboration with the Welsh Assembly Government and other key equality and economic agencies in Wales. The organisation is involved in consultation processes, campaigns and representation throughout Wales, the UK and Europe.

The organisation’s activities centre on research; advice and consultation; provision of information; running positive action and pro-active projects as well as providing training to employers.
Chwarae Teg has successfully:

- helped establish 25 day care nurseries for children under 5 years old throughout Wales in 1999
- given advice, information and training to over 2000 women and lone parents considering self-employment through the Women’s Enterprise Wales project and Lone Parent Venture
- developed work life balance pilot projects with large employers across Wales
- promoted training for women in non-traditional industries
- completed a major study on care in the economy of Wales – Making the Case for Care

Chwarae Teg were also instrumental in campaigning for and compiling the equal opportunities cross cutting themes chapters of the European Structural Funds programmes in Wales between 2000-2006. Consequently the writing of the equality guidelines for project development and management in 2001 and 2003 resulted in the documents being recognised as examples of best practice in the UK and Europe. Representatives from the organisation have since visited Brussels, Spain and Hungary to share expertise about gender mainstreaming in public policy.

The Equal Opportunities Commission

The Equal Opportunities Commission is a UK public body established to campaign and promote gender equality and has representation in Wales. The organisation provides support to individual taking legal cases forward and conducts comprehensive research on a range of relevant topics. The Commission:

- Sets the agenda with decision makers on gender equality
- Runs high profile campaigns to change public opinion as well as the law, for example on equal pay, the rights of pregnant women at work and the right to flexible working
- Uses legal powers of enforcement to investigate organisations or areas of life where sex discrimination is persistent
• Takes landmark legal case studies under the Sex Discrimination Act and the Equal Pay Act to improve the situation for women and men in the future. Cases include areas such as, pay, recruitment, pensions, education and sport

• Publishes research and statistics about women and men in Wales to show clearly where change is needed

• Builds powerful partnerships that can make change happen

Wales TUC Cymru

The Wales TUC was established in 1974. It is an integral part of the TUC and was set up to ensure that the role of the TUC is effectively undertaken in Wales.

The Wales TUC has 50 trade unions in membership, who in turn represent just under half a million union members or about 45% of all employees in Wales.

Trade union membership as a percentage of all employees is significantly higher in Wales than in other parts of Great Britain, and this has enabled the Wales TUC to exercise a significant level of influence in public affairs throughout Wales. The Wales TUC seeks to work with and make representations to other organisations at an all-Wales level.

Work on the gender pay gap in Wales has included:

• joint campaign with the Equal Opportunities Commission to close the pay gap

• training programmes for employers and union representatives in gender equality issues

• the Wales Women’s Committee as a driving force for highlighting gender pay gap

• utilising the Wales Union Learning Fund to sponsor research into work life balance issues in Wales
The Welsh Assembly Government’s Department of Enterprise Innovation and Networks (formerly the Welsh Development Agency)

The Welsh Development Agency was merged with the National Assembly for Wales in April 2006. Prior to this the organisation had been involved on both strategic and operational levels in working towards closing the gender pay gap in Wales. The Agency undertook many pieces of research into issues of women and the economy, and examined the barriers faced by women in self-employment. The value of the childcare market was examined for it’s contribution to the Welsh economy and in providing employment opportunities for women.

Operational involvement included the POTENTIA project, which provided under-represented groups in society with support and training to start their own business. This project also included the funding of Women’s Enterprise Wales and Lone Parent Venture. The Agency:

- Developed an Equal Pay Toolkit for small businesses – which attracted interest from other European member states
- Conducted research into gender segregation in the workplace
- Promoted the Work Life Balance Challenge Fund, which recognised good practice amongst small employers in Wales in relation to work life balance practices
- Completed research with the Equal Opportunities Commission to uncover the potential benefits of developing a pregnancy toolkit for Welsh SME’s.

In addition the highly successful SME Equality Project offered practical support and guidance to over 2,000 companies employing less than 250 people on how to ensure equality in the workplace and to effectively implement equality policy and practices. The project was developed in 1998 as a response to a recognised need to counteract the material barriers faced by women when accessing employment. As the focus developed it also included race, disability, sexual orientation, Welsh language, age, religion and belief. The project worked closely with Chwarae Teg, the Commission for Racial Equality, Disability Rights Commission, Stonewall Cymru, the Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service (ACAS), and the NHS Equality Unit in Wales, who all provided a strategic overview for the direction and evolution of the project and it’s objectives.
University of Wales, Bangor

The University has undertaken numerous pieces of research into the gender pay gap including:

- joint research with Chwarae Teg *Making the Case for Care*
- review of the Welsh Assembly Government’s strategy for carers
- major EQUAL 1 study on the barriers to employment in rural areas of those discriminated against, including women

The University runs a popular MA degree course in Women’s Studies, and is currently running a EQUAL funded project GWLAD - which supports women through lifelong learning and encourages them into non-traditional areas of training and skills development.

The Fawcett Society

The Fawcett Society has been actively involved in campaigning to close the gender pay gap for over 30 years. They have worked hard to campaign for changes to the equality legislations and undertaken numerous pieces of research to support their campaigns. They continue to be involved with governmental consultation and have worked in Wales in conjunction with Age Concern and Chwarae Teg. Their report on women and pensions *One in Four*, was launched in Wales in 2004.

The Society’s key achievements include:

- lobbying for changes in equality legislation such as the Sex Discrimination Act and Equal Pay Act
- influencing the Gender Public Duty legislation
- changing public attitudes and opinions towards the gender pay gap
This chapter examines the different reasons for the gender pay gap in Wales. It looks at the evidence, collated from recent studies and existing research, and identifies the implications for practice in relation to the economy and society as a whole. In addition, it includes examples of progress in certain areas and also recommends future action to help close the pay gap. The chapter looks specifically at:

- occupational segregation
- horizontal segregation
- contractual segregation
- discrimination
- workplace culture and work life balance

Finally, it examines other contributory factors such as pay practices, barriers and attitudes.

### 2.1 Occupational segregation

During the course of this research it became apparent that occupational segregation in Wales could be summed up as the four S’s:

- sector dominance
- self-employment
- stereotyping
- skills development
The Evidence

Sector Dominance

According to statistics occupational segregation (or vertical segregation) accounts for 20% of the gender pay gap.\textsuperscript{10} Facts and figures in this section are collated from recent pieces of research and data collected with relevance to the gender pay gap. It is by no means a precise picture of the current situation as difficulties encountered included the fact that many organisations and employers do not collect gender disaggregated data and had not conducted equality reviews.

Even though more women than ever are in work, and that statistics demonstrate that 47% of the workforce in Wales is female, there still exists a gender pay gap of 12% between the hourly earnings of women and men. Research shows that just three years after graduating, women earn 15% less than their male counterparts. One of the main reasons for the gender pay gap according to evidence from various sources is the fact that men and women still seem to work in occupations that are traditional for their gender (i.e. women in administration and hairdressing and men in construction and IT). Some of the these occupations for women are characterised by lower pay and prospects, whereas the male dominated occupations are much better paid and more contractually favourable.

Almost two-thirds of all employees in the voluntary sector in the UK are women\textsuperscript{11}. This reflects the situation in Wales. Employment contracts in this sector tend to be short-term due to reliance on various sources of funding and posts can be relatively low paid. According to the Equal Opportunities Commission gender segregation in the workforce is more profound in Wales than any other part of the UK.

The Labour Force Survey in 2004 demonstrated that 79% of the social care workforce was female. Data from the local authority workforce in Wales also shows social care to be an area in which the workforce is pre-dominantly part-time. The Local Government Data Unit staffing return for March 2005 showed that 52% of the Local Authority social care staff were part-time. This figure was much higher in certain areas of social care, such as domiciliary care, where part-time workers accounted for 87% of the workforce. Also, many of these staff do not have guaranteed contracted hours. With these

\textsuperscript{10} The Gender Pay Gap Fact Sheet (WEU, 2004)

\textsuperscript{11} The UK Voluntary Sector Almanac
elements put together there are large numbers of women working in part-time jobs with uncertain hours. Some of these women will also have more than one job to make ends meet.

Research by the Care Council for Wales in February 2006 demonstrated that 97% of practitioners in the childcare sector in Wales were women. It also reported that the average hourly rate for the childcare sector in Wales is £5.50 - this is less than half the average pay rate for women working full-time across the UK and just 10% above the rate of minimum wage. Recruitment of staff was highlighted as an area of concern in Care Council report. Evidence suggested that 75% of day care nurseries in Wales reported loss of staff over a 12 month period. The average working week for a childcare practitioner is 26 hours. It is worth noting however that the childcare sector in Wales is currently worth approximately £1 million per week to the Welsh economy.

The lowest salaries in Wales have been recorded in sectors such as administration, public services, fitness and beauty and the social care sector - which are all female dominated.

There is only 1% of women in the construction industry in Wales and 2% in engineering. Salaries in these sectors tend to be considerably higher than those in sectors dominated by women.

The Welsh Assembly Government’s Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks’ (formerly the Welsh Development Agency) SME Equality Project conducted a joint piece of research with the Equal Opportunities Commission into occupational segregation within SME’s in Wales. This piece of research was carried out by Swansea University in 2005. The Research found that occupational segregation had a negative and statistically significant effect on the financial performance of the SMEs surveyed. The research discovered that SME’s were more gender segregated than larger workplaces in Wales. Taking into account that approximately 96% of all employers in Wales are SME’s, these findings were very significant.

It also found that Wales is more segregated than anywhere else in the UK in relation to both SMEs and larger employers.

The research found that women in SME’s in Wales were concentrated in two main sectors:

- Distribution, Hotels and Catering
- Public Administration
Women were concentrated in administrative and secretarial posts. In Welsh SMEs 88% of employees in administrative and secretarial occupations are female compared with 72% and 74% respectively in larger firms. The research found SMEs in Mid Wales are more segregated than elsewhere in Wales, and that SMEs in South West Wales are least segregated when compared to the rest of Wales.

Other research conducted by recruitment consultancy Moloney Search demonstrated that female computer science graduates were opting out of careers in technology because they were being put off by the male dominated work environments. The survey found that 39 per cent of females graduating in computer science in 2005 chose not to pursue a career in their field of study. The survey also found that female graduates were put off by the lack of senior role models in organisations, as well as lack of career progression. Information from Chwarae Teg’s *Ready SET Go!* project, which promotes training opportunities for women in non-traditional industries in Wales, seems to support this notion.

**Self-employment – for women and lone parents**

According to the Equal Opportunities Commission back in 2000 there were twice as many men than women running their own business in Wales. In 2006 according to the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor\(^{12}\) this had increased to three women for every four men starting their own business. According to this report it cited that the high level of female entrepreneurs in Wales had helped maintain the growth of enterprise in Wales.

It also added that Wales had currently one of the best gender balances in enterprise in the whole world. In the majority of nations there are twice as many men as women entrepreneurs. In Wales therefore this is certainly heartening news for developments in closing the pay gap.

Research carried out by Chwarae Teg and the University of Wales, Lampeter as part of the *Women’s Enterprise Wales* project demonstrated that the motivational reasons for starting business sometimes differed for women and men. Women tended to chose self-employment for personal fulfilment, challenge and ambition. Women also choose self-employment as the preferred option for balancing work and caring responsibilities. Men were mostly motivated by money, or because of redundancy. In addition many

---

\(^{12}\) Global Entrepreneurship Monitor – 2005 Wales Executive Report, David Brookesbank and Dylan Jones Evans, National Entrepreneurship Observatory for Wales
factors were identified that deter and hinder women from starting their own business in Wales. These included:

- Accessing finance
- Attitudes of others
- Inappropriate and irrelevant training programmes
- Shortage of suitable business premises
- Lack of confidence

The CYFENTER Development Partnership undertook research into the factors that influence individuals when entering into the world of business. The research was undertaken between August 2003 and May 2004 and looked at factors influencing eight different under-represented groups including women and lone parents.

Key findings for women included:

- Over a third 34% of women who had started a business had been trading for between 2 and 4 years. This was higher than for men at 30%

- Popular business sectors for women included: retail, 14%; Health and Social Care, 11%; and Business Services, 92%

- 11% of women compared with 23% of men at pre-start stage thought they would need between £10,000 and £50,000 to start their business. 16% of women, compared with 5% of men, believed they would need less than £1,000 to start up

- 36% of women at the pre-start stage were of the opinion that they would employ 1-4 full time members of staff once in business. Men on the other hand were more confident, with 50% predicting that they would be employing 1-4 full time members of staff

- A high number of women both pre-start 78% and post start 67% sought business support before and during start-up. This compares with 74% pre and 59% post start up for men.

Key findings for lone parents included:

- 30% of lone parents’ businesses had been in existence for under a year. This is compared with 22% of non- lone parents
• 34% of pre-start and 33% of post start lone parents thought they needed between £1,000 and £5,000 to start up in business. This compares with 28% of non-lone parents at pre-start and 26% at post start

• A high proportion, 74% of lone parents were in receipt of benefits at pre-start, compared with 31% of non lone-parents. This follows through to post start with 45% of lone parents still in receipt of benefits, compared with 17% non-lone parents

• Whilst a high percentage of post start lone parents, 65% sought advice, before and during starting their business compared with 62% of non-lone parents, only 8% of lone parents sought advice after they had started trading, compared with 7% of non-lone parents

• Lone parents are amongst the least likely to apply for a grant to support the funding of their business, with only 27% doing so at a pre-start stage. This compares with 38% for non-lone parents

• The main reasons preventing lone parents from starting up in business was lack of start-up finance.

The main reason for lone parents setting up in business was the need for independence and to be their own boss.

**Stereotyping and young people**

Girls have consistently done better than boys academically throughout the last decade, but gender stereotyping persists.

Gender stereotyping is first seen in the home. It is clear that stereotyping exists within the family structure, and girls and boys are influenced by this by the time they reach school age and beyond. Even though attitudes are changing and men generally are taking more of an equal role in caring, gender stereotypes are still not being broken down early enough.

According to the Equal Opportunities Commission young people in Wales particularly young women are experiencing lack of career guidance, work placements and training opportunities that could help them make informed choices about their career including how to secure higher paid jobs. Instead young people are still being channelled towards gender traditional
occupations, and that the idea of ‘jobs for girls and jobs for boys’ continues to be advocated.

In July 2005, the Engineering Technology Board undertook a piece of research for England, Scotland and Wales that looked at Year 9 (11-19 age groups) career choices in schools, and how science, engineering and technology were considered at this stage as a viable career option for boys and girls. The findings were interesting as they demonstrated that science and IT were more popular with boys than girls, however there was a distinct lack of understanding about SET careers, with girls seeing science as caring for people and saving lives, and boys seeing science as something more practical making a link with industry. On the whole they did not realise that engineering for example involves skills and knowledge and that study could lead to a fulfilling career. The survey findings indicated that the majority of young people are thinking about future careers when they make their option choices in Year 9. This emphasises the need for Sector Skills Councils to connect with young people early, to provide information about a range of careers before they decide that a non-traditional path is not for them.

Characteristically careers advice for young people has not necessarily included detailed information about the possible salaries and promotion prospects of certain occupations.

According to the Economic and Social Research Council\(^\text{13}\), aspirations matter – young people who make an early decision to stay on at school tend to do better at both GCSE and A level, even if their home circumstances are unfavourable. And girls brought up in less traditionally ‘gendered’ roles tend to do better in education.

**Skills Development**

According the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report on social exclusion in Wales, women mostly choose lifelong learning for personal development reasons, whereas men’s reasons are more employment related. Education was mentioned as the single most important factor determining a woman’s earnings over a lifetime.

Apprenticeship programmes are the major government funded training route into work for young people from the age of 14, and are recognised as an

\(^{13}\) *Seven Ages of Man and Woman : A Look at life in Britain in the Second Elizabethan Era* - ESCR, 2004
important source of skills for the economy. However, the Equal Opportunities Commission’s *Formal Investigation into Workplace Segregation* in 2005 found that Apprenticeship Programmes are heavily gender segregated and that the current system perpetuates segregation or even makes it worse. The report demonstrated that in 2005, 98% of those in early years care and education apprenticeship programmes were female, and 99% of those on engineering and construction apprenticeships were male.

Research conducted by Chwarae Teg in 2005: *Gender Equality in Modern Apprenticeship Programmes in Wales*, demonstrated that even though some training providers and employers were taking pro-active steps to address the gender imbalance, very few examples of good practice could be seen.

According to the Trade Union Congress publication *Changing Times*, many young women are starting their careers with an inbuilt pay disadvantage because of an apprenticeship pay gap. The Equal Opportunities Commission demonstrated in their pay surveys that female apprentices aged 16 –25 earn 26 per cent less than their male equivalents. This gap is primarily due to the types of training young men and women do. In the best paid sectors, electro-technology and engineering, nearly 100 per cent of trainees are male. The worst paid sectors for apprenticeships are early years care and education and hairdressing, which are almost entirely female. Therefore, financially apprenticeship programmes are not working for women.

The Women and Work Commission report *Shaping a Fairer Future* made recommendations about the need to ensure that Sector Skills Councils should include tackling gender segregation in the Modern Apprenticeship programme as part of every Sector Skills Agreement.

Very often there is little or no financial help available for women or lone parents to undertake higher education courses in Wales. Those on income support or other benefits often find it difficult to access finance to pay college fees. When student loans are awarded these are quite often regarded as income, which means certain benefits are then withdrawn. In addition, those wishing to follow non-traditional degrees sometimes find that they have to study outside of Wales in order to find a suitable course.

It is foreseen that adult education will become even more popular as the knowledge economy takes hold and there is a growing understanding of the importance of continuing skills development throughout our working lives.
Implications for practice

• Because of lack of resources, flexibility and support many women are losing out, particularly older women who want to train or change their career path. This is leading to many women not being able to train and becoming frustrated and unhappy in their jobs. Their talent and potential is being wasted.

• There is a clear correlation between the employment sectors where men predominate and skill shortages, which shows that occupational segregation causes employers to miss out on a huge potential pool of labour with which to plug their skills gap. If this does not happen the skills gap is set to get wider over the next ten years.

• Unless attitudes of gender stereotyping are tackled within schools women and men will continue to choose traditional career paths. In addition they will become employers of tomorrow and reinforce gender stereotypical values and discriminatory practice.

• Without adequate encouragement and support some women who have set up in business will find it difficult to survive in a traditionally male dominated sector.

• Without tackling occupational segregation in skills development and employment one of the main contributory factors to the gender pay gap in Wales may also become one of the main contributory factors to family poverty.

Some examples of work in progress

• The National Assembly for Wales’ programme Reaching Higher funded a series of events for 11-16 year olds to explore what can be achieved through education and higher education in Wales. The scheme touched upon areas of equality, but further potential for promoting non-traditional training and employment could be an integral part of any future schemes.

• The Entrepreneurship Action Plan for Wales 2000-2006 included a target to increase new VAT registered businesses by 50% by the end of 2006. This strategy also included the challenge to create a greater number of sustainable businesses by women and other under-represented groups in
society. It is important that strategies like these continue to be developed, properly resourced and include the appropriate level of support needed to realise targets.

- Chwarae Teg’s *Women's Enterprise Wales Project* and *Lone Parent Venture*, formed part of the WDA’s POTENTIA programme for new business start-ups in Wales for under-represented groups. Both these projects which ended in 2006, proved highly successful positive action approaches to supporting and encouraging women to choose self-employment and become valuable commodities for the Welsh economy. Over 2000 women and lone parents receive assistance and support throughout Wales. (These projects are also featured in Chapter 5).

- Examples of good practice have been developed by training providers, Sector Skills Councils and employers as part of the Modern Apprenticeship Programme in Wales. These include pro-active approaches to attract female trainees; joint schools projects to provide ‘taster’ sessions of some industries and some practical methods of breaking down the barriers.

- The *Rhyl Women’s E-village* positive action project in North Wales has enabled many women to train and up-skill in IT within a comfortable and friendly environment. Many women have since gained employment from their new qualifications. (This project is also featured in Chapter 5).

- Chwarae Teg’s *Ready SET Go!* positive action project has trained and supported women through training in non-traditional areas including: dry-stone walling; painting and decorating and conservation. (This project is also featured in Chapter 5).

**Recommendations**

- The Sector Skills Councils need to play a key role in encouraging women to train and consider traditionally male dominate occupations.

- A national culture change is also needed in order to challenge assumptions about the types of jobs women and men can do.

- Wales needs an innovative role model and mentoring scheme as a method of spreading more of an awareness of the potential of careers in non-traditional sectors. This needs to include generating an entrepreneurial culture amongst women and lone parents in Wales.
The good practice from short-term positive action projects needs to be identified, highlighted and recognised, and built into long-term mainstream economic and businesses development strategies and services.

Further research is needed on tracking the development of female run businesses, on specific needs including rural based women and the value of women’s business in the economy and the community.

The Women and Work Commission report *Shaping a Fairer Future* published in February 2006, recommended that all education departments throughout the UK publish strategic documents describing how they will break down stereotypes within schools; the teaching profession, teacher training courses and careers services. Evidence from this research would support this recommendation.

A radical review of pay rates in the Modern Apprenticeship Programmes is urgently needed and requires addressing. The Equal Opportunities Commission also recommend the revision of the current Apprenticeship Programme, changing its name to ‘Career Start’ which could well make it instantly more attractive for prospective female trainees.

It is imperative that careers advice for young people includes detailed information about the salaries and prospective promotional opportunities of occupations. In addition, business focused work experience is essential to the broadening of girls’ career horizons.

Primary schools could do more to celebrate science week in order to raise awareness of the subject as a career choice amongst female pupils.

Breaking down the barriers of stereotyping needs to be done as part of the teacher training courses for all potential teachers.

Children need role models to aspire to in non-traditional areas of employment.
2.2 Vertical segregation (The glass ceiling effect)

This section will examine what has been generally referred to for many years as the ‘glass ceiling’ for women in work. The ‘glass ceiling’ is a term used to describe the barrier women face to career progression and senior management positions, and is another reason for the gender pay gap in Wales. It is thought that when women reach a certain point in their career they can go no further as they hit the glass ceiling that stops them from getting any higher. This ceiling exists due to discrimination, negative attitudes, workplace culture and sometimes lack of support and encouragement from others. In this chapter we will look specifically at:

- women into management
- women into public life

We will examine the factors that determine why the glass ceiling still exists in Wales, and how women can break through it successfully to achieve their aims and goals.

The Evidence

Women into management

According to the joint publication by the Equal Opportunities Commission and Wales Women’s National Coalition *Who Run’s Wales in 2006*, there was evidence that women were under-represented in almost every area of executive management in the public sector in Wales. It showed that there were no female chairs of police authorities or university vice-chancellors. Only 19% of head teachers, 20% of hospital consultants and 30% of newspapers editors in Wales were female.

As these numbers are so low it is no surprise to learn that the majority of recruitment panels for senior posts in Wales are male dominated. Research carried out by the Economic and Social Research Council reported that there was particular evidence in Wales of recruitment and selection processes not always being ‘gender neutral’.14

---

14 *Seven Ages of Man and Woman: A Look at Life in Britain in the Second Elizabethan Era* - 2004
**Women into public life**

Even though the National Assembly for Wales can boast a 50/50 gender split of members and a similar split in Cabinet Office, little progress has been made in the past two years to get more women into executive positions in Wales. The 2006 edition of *Who Runs Wales* expressed disappointment in the continuing gender imbalance in getting women into the leadership of public bodies in Wales.

Women in Wales are still being excluded from the boardrooms and council chambers where key decisions are made. Since the last report in 2004 the most dramatic change has been the doubling of women MP’s in Wales from four to eight – now 20% of all Welsh MP’s but there are no party leaders in Wales. Only 9% of local authority chief executives, 18% of council leaders and 22% of councillors in Wales are women. Evidence also suggests that this situation also perpetuates women’s feelings that politics is not for them.

Research by the Fawcett Society into women’s experience of candidate selection for MP’s in the UK carried out after the 2001 elections revealed both direct and indirect discrimination against women candidates, as well as instances of sexual harassment.

**Implications for practice**

- If public services are to meet the needs of our diverse society women must be a part of the management and decision process.

- Without a gender balance of women in senior positions, some families will continue to live in poverty, and the gender pay gap will continue to significantly blight society

- Welsh politics needs women. A healthy democracy is one that represents all it’s people and that is hard to achieve if sections of the community are relatively excluded. A better gender balance also makes electoral sense for individual parties. Electoral Commission research in the UK showed that in seats where a woman MP was elected to Parliament in 2001 higher percentages of both women and men reported having voted compared with seats where a man was elected.\(^{15}\) Such findings are quite significant at a time when the main parties are battling for women’s vote.

---

\(^{15}\) Electoral Commission (2004) *Gender and Political participation*
According the Equal Opportunities Commission: “if we select from only half of the population, how can we expect to get the best person every time?” This is a shameful waste of talent year after year.

Women also need to be represented in public life to ensure that policy decisions are not indirectly discriminating against women or lone parents.

Women can also ensure that important issues such as childcare and discrimination are moved further up the agenda. Ensuring that everyone’s views are represented leads to more responsive services and a fairer society. Leaders have less legitimacy if they only reflect part of the population.

Politics seem irrelevant to many people when it appears white and male.

Some examples of work in progress

Chwarae Teg has run a series of workshops on Women into Management which proved very successful and popular. However, more funding is needed to develop an all Wales programme for prospective female managers.

The Wales Women’s National Coalition, a voluntary organisation representing women’ groups in Wales has been actively involved since 1999 in promoting the participation of women at decision making levels. One of the three keys themes of the Coalition is: women into public life. The organisation has run many campaigns to promote more women politicians and work very closely with the Equal Opportunities Commission, Chwarae Teg and the National Assembly for Wales.

Positive action such as all-women shortlists has dramatically increased women’s representation. All-women shortlists have been the subject of attack by sections of the media, certain politicians and some political activists in Wales, however, if gender balance is not being achieved in the mainstream other direct measures need to be taken to move things forward. According to the Fawcett Society no country has ever significantly increased it’s level of women’s representation without the use of positive action mechanisms by some of the parties.

Some companies in Wales are trying to take pro-active approaches such as advertising in female magazines. Some large banks have also changed their leadership catchphrase to something more inclusive of women.
• The National Assembly for Wales can boast a 50% gender split of members, which is the highest representation of women in government in the world.

**Recommendations**

✓ The government and employers needs to ensure that the new legal Gender Equality Duty coming into force in 2007 has the potential to transform public services in Wales, by requiring that all public bodies promote gender equality in employment practices. This needs to include women ascending to positions of power to ensure equality is fully realised.

✓ Mentoring schemes for employers and individuals would be effective in increasing the number of women at the top of their chosen profession.

✓ A nationally funded *Women into Management* programme is needed in order to reach all prospective female managers.

✓ Organisation that work to take pro-active approaches need to continue with their campaign of getting more women into senior positions in Wales. This is essential if the glass ceiling is to be broken once and for all.
2.3 Contractual Segregation

Contractual segregation is about the hours that women and men work during the week. This is a contributory factor to the gender pay gap as women make up the majority of part-time workers in Wales, and part-time salaries tend to be low with little or no career prospects.

The Evidence

Women often choose to work part-time due to caring responsibilities. It is sometimes difficult, particularly for families with more than one child to effectively balance working and caring. This means that the majority of those who work part-time in Wales are women. This does not mean that women who work part-time should be treated less favourably, or not give the same opportunities as their full-time counterparts.

Information from the research carried out by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation in 2005 demonstrated that 60% of all part-time workers in Wales were paid less than £6.50 an hour. Two thirds of the part-time workers were women. Amongst full-time employment 25% of women were paid less than £6.50 an hour compared to 15% of men. Therefore, according to the report half of those on low pay in Wales were part-time workers, and 5 out of 6 part-time workers were women. This means that two thirds of all low paid workers in Wales are women. Of women and men on low pay a quarter are over 50 years of age.

Contractual segregation is a major contributor to the pay gap in Wales, and according to UK statistics accounts for 38% of the gender pay gap. Some of the reasons for this gap are due to part-time workers having lower levels of qualifications and less work experience. However, it is also due to part-time work being concentrated in lower paid occupations and industries.

According to research both male and female part-time workers receive 40% less training than their full-time counterparts. This lack of training may have important consequences for their future earnings capacity.\[16\]

According to Britain’s Brain Drain, research by the Equal Opportunities Commission launched in September 2005, in Wales 46 per cent of working women and 10 per cent of working men work part-time. This amounts to 350,000 workers in Wales – 276,000 of which are women and 74,000 men.

\[16\] Olsen and Walby, 2004
4 out of 5 part-time workers or 280,000 people say they are working below their potential. This means they are using fewer skills and have less responsibility than in previous jobs. The report highlighted the damage caused by old fashioned thinking about work, which leads to men, who mostly work full-time, working among the longest hours in the EU and to women, over two-fifths of whom work part-time, ending up in low paid jobs with no prospects.

Implications for practice

- The part-time pay gap in Wales remains a shocking 40% - a figure that hasn’t reduced for 30 years since the introduction of the Equal Pay Act. If equality for part-time workers is not addressed this will continue to be the case.

- According to statistics of all those holding down 2 waged jobs in Wales two thirds of them are women. Women will continue to struggle to hold down two jobs if fair pay and conditions for part-time workers are not addressed.

- Employers are failing to make best use of the considerable skills and experience of those who work part-time. This is leading to a waste of talent and potential within the workforce, which could be utilised to fill the skills gaps.

- Part-time workers are being put under undue workloads and stress, particularly those who have adjusted their working hours. Employers are failing to address the fact that reduction in hours also means a reduction in workload.

Some examples and work in progress

- The best employers are leading the way, moving away from presenteeism to giving people choice in how they work simply because they recognise it’s good for business, fitting the demands of a 24/7 world and improving staff morale. But the pace of change is still slow.

- The introduction of the employment regulations on the right to request flexible working has helped many women who choose to work part-time. However, concentrating women in low paid, low prospects jobs is not helping the pay gap.
Recommendations

- Businesses should be encouraged to reap the benefits that flexibility can bring, and afford those who work part-time the same training and promotional opportunities as full-time workers.

- A comprehensive review of the part-time pay penalty in Wales should be undertaken and recommendations made on how to tackle the pay inequality between part-time and full-time work.

- Training subsidies should be available to part-time workers to help them with career progressions and making the transition into full-time employment.

- There is a need to change the long hours culture in the UK as whole. Part-time jobs should be just as valued as full-time jobs and not influenced by the number of hours you work in a day or week.

- The Equal Opportunities Commission report called for the government to extend the right to request flexible working to all, and halt this waste of potential and to stop the economic and human damage caused by work-related stress.

2.4 Discrimination

According to this research discrimination in the workplace can be twofold:

- discrimination on the grounds of pay
- women being treated less favourably than men at work

The Evidence

Equal Pay

According to research on the gender pay gap by Swansea University in 2003, discrimination at work accounted for 45-50% of the total hourly gender pay gap.
Preliminary findings of the government-commissioned Equalities Review reported that mothers face greater discrimination in finding a job than disabled people, Asian women and older people. It found that women returning to work after starting a family face the highest 'personal employment penalty' of any group in society. Lone parents with children under 11 years of age were 41% more likely than others to be unemployed.

As Blackaby et al (2001)\textsuperscript{17} explain:

‘discrimination can enter a pay system in a variety of ways. For example, it can occur when: jobs predominantly carried out by men are valued more highly than those predominantly carried out by women; additional payments related to experience, merit or performance are distributed to jobs mainly performed by men and not women; there is greater scope for discretion for individual managers in pay progression decisions; individualised starting salaries are negotiated or there is greater use of individualised performance awards. Where payment system is transparent, it can be readily checked for fairness and consistency and the potential for pay discrimination is reduced.’

2 out of 3 employers have not done a pay review and have no plans to do so. This figure has not changed much since comprehensive research was undertaken in 2001. This is reflected in the information provided by the Cytgord survey in Chapter 4 of this book.

**Discrimination at work**

The Equal Opportunities Commission reported that over a 1,000 women each year take legal action against their employer claiming they were sacked because of their pregnancy. In one shocking case in 2004 an office manager was advised to have an abortion by her boss or face the sack. In general the Equal Opportunities Commission helpline in Wales receives more enquiries about pregnancy discrimination than no other, this accounts for 40% of all enquiries. Statistics demonstrate that 1 in 10 employers in Wales try to pay pregnant women to leave their job.

For many pregnant women their employers’ attitude change within minutes of hearing the news and many women are quickly shown the door. Pregnant women are often forced to change their role, their hours and salary or find a new job. Many women have to leave their job because of health and safety

\textsuperscript{17} The Gender Pay Gap in Wales - Blackaby, D., Moore, N., Murphy, P., and O'Leary, N. (2001)
issues. Some women have to leave their job because their request for flexible working is refused by their employer.

Some small business owners are extremely hostile and openly admit to not wanting to employ women in case they get pregnant. That means effectively they are not considering employing 50% of the potential workforce.

Pregnancy and maternity law forms part of the Employment Rights Act 1996, the Sex Discrimination Act 1975 and the Health and Safety at Work Regulations 1999. It is incredibly complicated and complex process to bring a legal case to justice and there is little support available for those who are being discriminated against. The lack of free legal advice is also deterring women from pursuing a claim. Pregnancy discrimination is costing Wales dearly. Women are losing their jobs, their confidence and career aspirations, and employers are paying the price in recruitment and retention of a good, skilled workforce.

Research carried out for the BBC suggested that a majority of employers in Britain prefer not to offer jobs to women thought likely to take time off work to have children. It was estimated that every year almost a quarter of a million women lose their jobs or face discrimination because they become pregnant.

For 30 years it has been illegal to force women out of their jobs because of pregnancy. But changing attitudes is more difficult. Small companies in particular sometimes complain it’s disruptive to keep jobs open only to find a woman then chooses not to return.

The study by the Recruitment and Employment Confederation for the BBC’s Money Programme found that three quarters of employers, questioned had admitted telling recruiters they’d rather not employ pregnant women, or those likely to have children. Case studies of three women followed by the Programme suggested that while winning a sex discrimination tribunal case is tricky, getting your career back after losing your job through pregnancy is even more difficult.

In addition, research in Wales has suggested that choices open to men and women are crucially influenced by recruitment and selection processes and there is some evidence that these are not always ‘gender neutral’. 18

---

18 Seven Ages of Man and Woman: A Look at Life in Britain in the Second Elizabethan Era – ESRC, 2004
Recruitment and harassment

There is also evidence from the Equal Opportunities Commission and from solicitors in Wales about cases of sexual harassment, victimisation and discrimination in recruitment practices in Wales.

Implications for practice

- Human Resources managers seem to be clearly more comfortable discussing equal opportunities issues in general than equal pay specifically, thinking that by tackling the wider issue the pay gap would resolve eventually. In addition personnel staff feel that their responsibilities do not include supervision of equal pay. According to research it also seems that Human Resources managers generally lack the authority to achieve equal pay.

- Due to the fact that most employers have not conducted an equal pay audit, and that many individuals don't feel comfortable taking cases forward employers are thinking that they have no equal pay issues. This is a significant issue taking into account the majority of employers in Wales are SME’s (approximately 96%).

- Discrimination at work leads to some part-time workers not having access to a pension schemes. This is surprising, given that exclusion of part-timers from occupational pensions schemes has been unlawful since 1995.

- Even after 30 years of gender equality legislation only 60% of employers have an equal pay policy.

- By discriminating against women employers are effectively missing out on 50% of the workforce pool.

- By undertaking an equal pay audit and working out a solution to the findings, organisations could save themselves money, not only on legal fees, but also in other areas, such as recruitment and retention.
Some examples and work in progress

- Research conducted by the Equal Opportunities Commission in 2000 focused on identifying gender equality pay practices, it found that most of those employers who had taken specific steps to promote gender equality of pay were from the public sector. Other employers from the service sector were aware that they had not done enough, but would do so in the future, and organisations from the manufacturing sector had taken steps to improve pay generally.

- The Welsh Assembly Government (formerly the Welsh Development Agency) conducted research into the potential benefits of developing a pregnancy toolkit for small businesses in Wales. A similar toolkit is already being used successfully in England, but this new proposal would take into account the specific requirements of businesses in Wales.

- The Equal Opportunities Commission issued a Code of Practice on equal pay for large employers in 1997 and together with the Trade Union Congress developed and promoted an Equal Pay Kit for small businesses in 2005. The toolkit, *Equal Pay, Fair Pay* made a significant impact in Wales. Over 2000 small businesses have used the toolkit and business advisors in Wales are also promoting its use with employers.

- The Equal Opportunities Commission along with the TUC and the Welsh Assembly are currently running an equal pay campaign called *Close the Pay Gap*. This campaign has been running for a few years and targets primarily the public sector. (This campaign is featured in Chapter 5).

- The TUC conducted a phase of equal pay partnership training whereby some major private sector companies and unions embarked on joint gender pay reviews. Contemporary research suggests that training alone is unlikely to address pay disparities. A new study concludes that the future of collective bargaining is a central role that trades unions can play in tackling gender pay disparities. The TUC are also developing an Equal Pay Training distance learning course, which will take learners through the equal pay process and is an OCN accredited course.

- Some of the private sector large companies are also demonstrating good practice in pay reviews and equal pay implementation, but SME’s are finding it harder to be pro-active.
A collaborative approach between public and voluntary organisations established the Gender Budget Group in Wales. This project has funded a short-term post to raise awareness of the issues and identify the potential of examining budgets from a gender perspective to avoid discrimination.

Recommendations

- Large and small employers need to ‘own’ the issue of equal pay. They need to recognise that discrimination can still exist even they think that it doesn’t.

- Senior managers and line managers need to take responsibility for ensuring equal pay is a matter of priority. Employers need to give authority to Human Resources Managers to enable them to address equal pay and other discriminatory issues.

- There needs to be a sharing and communicating of best practice with large and small employers.

- An electronic advice service is needed for employers in Wales to access on-line. This would give information and advice on how to conduct gender equality reviews and signpost them to the appropriate advice agency.

- Provision of specific guidance and practical support to small companies would prove particularly useful on parental rights and pregnancy law.

- Extra financial support for businesses employing less than 10 staff is needed. Many parts of Wales have clusters of micro – businesses who need specialist advice and support, especially newly established companies.

2.5 Workplace Culture

Workplace culture has changed over the years. Even though some workplaces still promote the long hours culture as a factor in productivity and success, in general there are more flexible working practices being implemented by employers across Wales than ever before. However, workplace culture needs to embrace the benefits of work life balance because it makes good business sense and not just because the law insists on it.
Many employers in Wales both large and small have adopted successful approaches to promoting work life balance and as a result are reaping the rewards in staff recruitment, retention rates and productivity. But not all employers see work life balance as being beneficial to their business. Small businesses in particular are still having difficulty making the links between flexible working and good business. Women and lone parents are still penalised for taking career breaks for caring, and when they return to the labour market they face difficulty in juggling working and caring responsibilities because the workplace is not flexible to their needs. It is also important to note that work life balance is not just for parents and carers, it’s for everyone, and it benefits everyone. Raising awareness and changing culture within the workplace is essential if the workforce is to be treated equally and fairly in Wales.

The Evidence

Career breaks for caring

Research has found that the gender pay gap is also caused by what happens when individuals take career breaks. Women are much more likely than men to take career breaks, mostly because of care responsibilities. Those who take career breaks not only lose earnings but are also penalised through their lack of pensions contributions, and some employers do not look favourably upon those who have been out of the job market for a few years.

According to UK statistics women’s caring responsibilities account for 15% of the gender pay gap.

Adult Care

Statistics demonstrate that 45% of all women who provide unpaid care for adults for more than 50 hours a week are in full time employment and 55% are in part-time employment. Unpaid care is help and support given to family, friends, neighbours or others because of long-term health problems, disability or old age. Unpaid care is currently carried out by 340,000 people in Wales. Women make up the majority of adult carers in Wales.

Chwarae Teg’s research Better Care Better Business conducted in 2001, demonstrated that although there had been an immense growth in the research literature and support for carers, it could be claimed that the

---

19 Facts about Women and Men in Wales, 2005 – The Equal Opportunities Commission
employer’s interest in the possibility of their employees being carers away from work had not matched the growth.

Combining work and care is most likely to occur between the ages of 45 – 64, forcing them to give up their work when their skills are at their highest level, but caring can increasingly arise at any age. There is also some clustering of carers in lower level jobs. According to research working carers are less well qualified than other employees, and may need extra support through education and skills policies.20

**Childcare**

According to Chwarae Teg’s scoping study in 2003, *Making the Case for Care*, women and lone parents returning to the labour market after time spent looking after children often find it difficult to find a job that matches their skills. Those looking for part-time work tend to crowd into a narrow range of lower paying occupations due to a lack of quality part-time jobs. Often they have to change employer and occupation – and accept lower pay – to get part-time work. This means that their skills are being under-utilised and this represents lost productivity for the Welsh economy. There is a need to address this waste of talent and the negative impact that career breaks can have on women’s and lone parents earnings.

**Health and well-being**

Evidence from the Health and Safety Executive21 suggests that ensuring work life balance and flexibility has a direct impact on the health and well-being of all staff. It reduces absenteeism and addresses workplace stress.

By introducing flexible working practices and piloting new initiatives the Chwarae Teg’s *Work Life Balance Pilot Project* with Local Authorities in Wales resulted in one Local Authority being able to reduce absenteeism by 30% in 12 months.

---

21 *Leadership in Health and Safety, A company case study* – The Health and Safety Executive
And everyone else!

The Chwarae Teg’s *Work Life Balance Pilot Project* also helped one Local Authority in Wales to reduce their recruitment costs by 50% in 2 years. This was achieved by simply, by introducing flexibility into the workplace. The project demonstrated that work life balance benefits everyone in the end from those with caring responsibilities, to people with health issues; those with particular sexual orientation or religious belief, and those who benefited from the occasional afternoon off to pursue a hobby.

Implications for practice

- At some time in the working life span of an employee there is usually a time for caring. This may be long or short term and the employee’s strategies for working, caring and coping will be assisted by workplace ‘family friendly policies’.

- The availability of a carer’s support package at work that takes into account time off, remuneration, job status and flexible working practices results in a reduction of staff wastage, training and recruitment costs.

- Four out of five employees in the UK say that work life balance considerations play a crucial role in deciding whether to stay with their current employer or leave, according to research from HR consultancy Watson Wyatt.

- Many women are looking for employers who have flexible working patterns and proven work life balance practices. This seems a lot more important to many women these days than higher salaries and status at work.

- By addressing the needs of the individual carer or parent, a valuable member of staff may not be lost.

- The *Work UK Survey* – conducted from a representative sample of 3,000 private workers in the UK – found that nearly 80% believe work-life balance is a very important consideration – if not the key consideration – to leave for a new job.

- Women who have taken career breaks over the years often end up with minimal pensions. Raising the age of retirement for women from 60 to 65 between 2010 and 2020, which is proposed by the present government, will give women more opportunity to contribute. However, this will be too
little too late for many women who face poverty now or in the next 10 years. At present just 23 per cent of women retiring at 60 qualify for the full basic state pension because so few build up enough contributions.

Some examples and work in progress

- Carers UK have developed a Managers Guide for employing carers, as well as a guide for working carers. These guides help both employers and their employees understand the implications of working of caring, and offers practical guidance on overcoming barriers and promoting work life balance.

- Carers Wales launched the ACE project (Action for Carers in Employment) in Wales in 2002. This two-year European funded project established partnerships of employers and support organisations to influence practice and provide support and advice for carers in employment.

- Chwarae Teg’s Welsh Assembly Government sponsored Work Life Balance Pilot Project was completed in 2005. Chwarae Teg is currently working with some primary and secondary schools throughout Wales to help promote the Teacher Workload Agreement programme. This includes piloting innovative work life balance initiatives amongst teachers.

- The Work Life Balance Challenge Fund was an initiative by the then Welsh Development Agency that provided SME’s in Wales with funding to help support their work life balance practices.

Recommendations

- Company managers need to be trained and supported in work life balance issues. Developing networks within the organisations can also help.

- The Women and Work Commission in their report Shaping a Fairer Future, recommended that part-time workers and those on career breaks should receive pro-rata treatment form professional bodies for membership fees, and training provision to support the retention of women in the professions.

- The Employment Regulations of Right to Flexible Working to be extended to cover all carers and parents.
Employment programmes such as New Deal 50+ need to be aware of the needs of carers and make necessary adjustments.

Allow the second 6 months of paid maternity leave to be shared between mothers and fathers equally.

The pensions rights for those who have taken career breaks to care for others and those with interrupted work histories needs to be enhanced.

There is a need to introduce a universal basic level of state pension, with strengthened supplementary state pension provision in retirement for low earners and those undertaking unpaid parenting and caring commitments.

All employers large and small can promote work life balance. All employers need to develop work life balance policies and practice to benefit all employees. Employers who have already adopted policies must focus on measuring the levels of work-life balance within their organisations to enable them to develop strategies that help employees to achieve a greater control over their working lives.

2.6 Barriers to work

Sometimes women and lone parents find it difficult to access training and employment because of the practical barriers that prevent them from doing so. Some of these barriers include: care provision; travel and being doubly disadvantaged. They could be overcome by making a few simple adjustments, others need proper frameworks and strategies to be put into place as well as investment of resources to ensure that these barriers are broken down for good. Only then can women and lone parents be able to participate fully and equally in the labour market.

The Evidence

Care

The lack of adequate, accessible and affordable care provision for parents and carers is an acute problem in Wales. According to the Joseph Rowntree
research in 2005\textsuperscript{22} on average there are 6 children to every day-care or childminding place in Wales. In rural areas and the Valleys the number of children for places is much higher than average, as high as 19 children for every place in Blaenau Gwent.

In the study 70\% of parents in Wales, through choice or not, depended on informal care arrangements for their children particularly grandparents. Childcare is a specific barrier to work for lone parents. 40\% of those working less than 16 hours a week said that problems with affording childcare was the main reason why they could not work more hours.

According to the Fusion Partnership’s research \textit{The Childcare Market in Wales, 2003}, there was a distinct lack of Welsh language childcare provision in Wales. According to the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales, this still seems to be case in 2006.

Even when childcare provision is available, the cost in itself is prohibitive. The Daycare Trust published their survey findings in 2005 where the average cost of a full-time nursery place in Wales for a child under 2 was £120. The average earnings in Wales in 2005 was £441\textsuperscript{23} a week. Even if a parent is entitled to the highest contribution of Working Tax Credit they are still having to pay approximately £40 a week for a place at day nursery.

30\% of all women between the ages of 25–50 who were economically inactive in 2005 stated child/dependent care as the main reason.

As previously mentioned in this chapter recruitment of staff to the childcare sector was highlighted as an area of concern in research carried out by the Care Council for Wales. Evidence suggested that 75\% of day care nurseries in Wales reported loss of staff over a 12 month period. This of course has a knock-on effect on childcare provision in general. Employers cited low wages being a deterrent for people considering entering the childcare sector. This sector is also characterised by low pay, and very few opportunities for personal development and career progression.

According to the Chwarae Teg’s research \textit{Making the Case for Care}, there is also a lack of adequate alternative care for adults and disabled children. The government proposed initiative ‘free care for disabled people’ was welcomed by carers in Wales in 2005, but this has since failed to be implemented.

\textsuperscript{22} \textit{Monitoring Poverty and Social Exclusion in Wales 2005}  
\textsuperscript{23} Office of National Statistics, 2005
In the past the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales have expressed concern that the regimes and systems in place for placing people into care is not giving people the freedom of choice with regard to their care. Care provision has to reflect the diverse community that we live in – this is a challenge yet to be addressed. This inevitably puts added strain on those carers who work.

**Travel**

According to statistics this accounts for 5% of the gender pay gap. Indications show that this could be as high as 10% in Wales\(^\text{24}\).

An important dimension in the numbers of car owners and those using public transport in Wales is the gender issue. Women are far less likely to own a car and are less likely to possess a driving licence than men. They are therefore more likely to be dependent on public transport and experience poor travel service as a barrier to work. According to the Joseph Rowntree research: 80% of those using public transport in the Valleys said the service was insufficient to their needs during the week.

A study by the Welsh Consumer Council\(^\text{25}\) showed that there were still many ways in which men’s and women’s life experiences differ, this included travel. According to the study, public transport planners tend to provide ‘a one size fits all’ service to customers, assuming men and women’s travel patterns and needs are largely similar. Figures in Wales demonstrate that 56% of women are frequent or occasional users of buses, compared to just 39% of men, whereas 77% of men drive and have access to a car, compared to 57% of women.

Women also are more likely to do irregular shifts and to need to work outside normal working hours. Women are also more likely to be travelling with luggage and pushchairs or escorting someone they care for.

Generally in rural areas, on average, women spend less time commuting than men. One reason for this is the time constraints that women face due to balancing work and caring responsibilities. This and other factors, impact on women’s pay in two ways. Firstly, they will have smaller pool of jobs to choose from and they will face greater competition owing to more women wanting to work in the same area (i.e. near where they live), which in turn results in lower wages for those jobs.

\(^{24}\) Monitoring Poverty and Social Exclusion in Wales 2005, Joseph Rowntree Foundation
\(^{25}\) Gender and Bus Travel, Briefing Paper – Welsh Consumer Council, December 2005
Half of all lone parents in Wales do not own a car. The majority (90%) of lone parents in Wales are women.

Most women and men who wish to enter employment would choose to do so locally, according to Summit Skills – the Sector Skills Council for Building Services Engineering. In England as a whole only 16% of men and 9% of women usually travel more than 20 kilometres each day to work. In parts of rural Wales many women and men have to travel at least this far to access employment.

**Being doubly disadvantaged**

Being a woman or lone parent may seem difficult enough when facing barriers or discrimination, but some are also doubly disadvantaged making it even more difficult for them to access training and employment.

In Wales, jobs in the public sector seem to be particularly important in the employment of women from black minority ethnic groups, as half of women from African-Caribbean backgrounds work in this sector. Bangladeshi and Pakistani women felt doubly disadvantaged by racism and sexism according to a UK study by the Women’s National Commission. They felt that they needed to be given access to position of power, in order to steer changes. Asian women also felt oppressed by white women in the workplace.

A high level of caring among some ethnic minority groups, especially at younger ages, suggest these carers face additional barriers in accessing paid employment and career opportunities.

The National Assembly for Wales has no ethnic minority women members. In England and Wales there is only one ethnic minority woman recorded in the senior judiciary, a high court judge.

Up until now there has been no legislation dealing with age in Britain. That all changes on 1 October 2006 when the Age Regulations come into force and outlaws age discrimination in employment and vocational training. It is a law that reflects our changing lifestyle and economy. The days when people worked hard to retire early are fading fast. In Ireland, where age discrimination legislation was introduced in 1999, complaints of age discrimination made up 22% of claims brought in 2004. That compares with 23% on the grounds of race and 24% on the grounds of gender. While not everyone could have a race or gender claim, everyone could have an age claim.
Disabled people in Wales find it difficult to access public transport, as most services are not adapted to their needs.

According to the Disability Rights Commission disabled people are twice as likely as non-disabled people to be unemployed or have low skills.

Although the number of older workers is increasing according to the Government statistics the relatively low level of employment among older workers costs the economy £19-30 billion a year in lost output. There are 8.75m people aged between 50 and state pensions age. This accounts for 25% of the working age population in Britain.

According to the Welsh Language Board many Welsh-speaking people find the lack of Welsh language advice and information on careers and self-employment to be a barrier to participation.

Many women also suffer a ‘double whammy’ first as they bring up children and later in life care for their ill or frail relatives.

**Attitudes**

“Until behaviour and attitudes in schools no longer reinforce stereotyped gender roles, children will continue to grow up reinforcing discriminatory attitudes and practices.”

[The Church of Scotland Guild]

Changing attitudes to stereotyping is just as important for men as for women and lone parents. The childcare profession in Wales is dominated by women, men find it extremely difficult to enter this sector due to traditional stereotypical values of caring being a woman’s role in society. The gender pay gap would be addressed in the same way by breaking down the barriers for men to be represented in female dominated occupations.

Research conducted by the Halifax Building Society’s home insurance division in March 2006, reported that men are still struggling to accept women’s skills and abilities as plumbers and electricians. Interestingly, the report also referred to the fact that female plumbers and electricians had a long way to go to win the confidence of other women as well. More than two thirds of women surveyed as part of the research said that they would feel
more comfortable letting a male tradesperson into their home. It appears that the UK as a whole could still be sticking to traditional perceptions of tradespeople.

Implications for practice

- When formal day care is not available or too expensive families are increasingly relying on grandparents to look after their children. Informal childcare plays a key role for families in rural areas of Wales. Many grandparents are caring before or after retirement without additional income and are sometimes sacrificing their own opportunities for economic activity.

- The regulations and standards issued by the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales can also be barrier to many childcare businesses who struggle to meet the requirements due to staffing shortages and lack of resources. Even though it is accepted that high standards are needed for provision of care, many decide not to continue in the profession because of too much red tape.

- Without adequate, affordable and accessible care provision, many carers and parents will continue to be economically inactive.

- Even though women should be encouraged to pursue non-traditional areas of employment, unless the pay and conditions in the care sector are addressed more women will leave in search of better salaries and job prospects. This will have a knock on effect on provision, which ultimately affects women who are working and caring.

- Women and lone parents who rely on public transport to access training and employment will continue to find it difficult if radical changes in the transport system are not introduced.

- Lone parents who cannot afford to own a car and find accessing public transport difficult risk becoming isolated from society. This will have an adverse effect on their confidence and ability to seek employment, and ultimately keep them and their children in poverty for many years.
Some Examples and Work in Progress

- The all Wales *Genesis Project* provides advice, guidance, support and childcare for people wanting to get back into work, training or other learning opportunities. The overall aim of Genesis is to remove barriers to people finding employment as a means to improve their economic activity. The project is run in each local authority area.

- Carers Wales have worked for many years to campaign for better care provision and support for carers in employment. They work closely with other equality organisations and the Welsh Assembly Government to improve care provision throughout Wales.

- The establishment of the Skills for Care and Development in 2005 as the Sector Skills Council for the social care sector in Wales was warmly welcomed. It will be interesting to review the development of the Council after it’s first twelve months and it’s potential to influence and radically improve provision as a whole.

- The European funded *Stepping Out To Independence* project run in Flintshire, North Wales breaks down the transport barriers for lone parents through the funding of driving lessons, and by helping them move towards owning their own car. This project is due to end in 2006.

- Chwarae Teg has delivered comprehensive equality training to staff of large public bodies in Wales including the National Assembly for Wales, in order to raise understanding and knowledge of how to mainstream equality from professional and personal perspectives.

- In 2005 the Equal Opportunities Commission established a Race Equality Focus Group to ensure that gender equality campaigns and pro-active approaches are as inclusive as possible. They also worked with Stonewall Cymru (the national organisation in Wales that promotes the rights of gay, lesbian and bi-sexual people) to brief employers on the Employment Regulations on sexual orientation.
Recommendations

- The Welsh Assembly Government’s Childcare Action Plan should be delivered with particular consideration for increasing childcare provision throughout the whole of Wales. Adequate resources need to be allocated for the successful implementation of the Action Plan.

- To monitor changes and progress within the social care sector in Wales the Sector Skills Council needs to undertake an annual workforce survey. This sector’s needs and deserves to be recognised and adequately resourced as a cornerstone of the Welsh economy.

- A tax-break for carers would help them manage financially. Employers could offer a voucher for employees with caring responsibilities, similar to those available to buy childcare.

- Guidance should be issued to local authorities and transport consortia on how to meet the identified needs of different groups effectively, including women and men – this would include issues of route, frequency and reliability.

- Local authorities and transport providers need to ensure that bus travel and bus stations are safe, especially for those travelling at night.

- Bus availability needs to meet the needs of those depending on public transport in rural areas to access training or employment.

- The interior design of buses should be improved to easily accommodate pushchairs, wheelchairs and luggage.

- More comprehensive research is needed on the impact of being doubly disadvantaged on the gender pay gap.

- Employers need to take steps to tackle discrimination across the board.

- Careers support and advice should take into consideration that some people face considerable barriers to training and employment.
2.7 Other reasons

Part of the complexity surrounding the issue of gender pay gap arises out of the increasingly intricate ‘packages’ that employers offer some of their employees. These can include bonuses and overtime, performance related pay, enhanced pensions, health insurance, company cars and training.

The Evidence

Research suggests that women generally are too scared to ask for a pay rise. Findings published in the UK women’s magazine Grazia in January 2006 reported that women found asking for a pay rise ‘one of the most stressful things that they had ever done,’ whereas men did not seem to suffer the same inhibitions. The survey also found that women in the South East of England are the most likely to ask for a pay rise, whereas Welsh women and those from Northern Ireland were the least likely to pluck up courage and demand a rise.

It also evident in some UK research\(^\text{26}\) that managers look for different attributes in men and women when valuing performance or considering pay awards. Managers tend to value dynamism and assertiveness in males and organisation and thoroughness in females. This reinforces stereotypes.

Implications for practice

- These factors should only be considered as contributory factors to the gender pay gap, as it would not do justice to hold women themselves responsible for their lower salaries. Women should be encouraged to ask for more pay and challenge discrimination where it occurs.

\(^{26}\) The Gender Pay Gap, 2001 – Women and Equality Unit
Chapter 3

Assumptions and evidence about women and men in the labour market in Wales

Assumption 1: Putting children in day care nursery during most of the week is detrimental to their educational and social development

What impact do working mothers have on their children? This is one of the more contentious issues among social scientists, and certainly one of the most emotive. In 1999, Panorama’s screening of Missing Mum provoked a media furore with its implication that children of working mothers were more likely to do poorly at school. Evidence since then has been mixed, with Bergman and Scott (2001) finding only a small effect of early maternal employment, which does not persist beyond GCSE. Studying the 1958 ad 1970 cohorts, Joshi and Verropolou (2000) find a small negative effect on educational attainment for children whose mothers went out to work before they were one, but no effect when mothers went out to work later and possibly some positive effects on later psychological adjustment.

Ermisch and Francesconi (2002) find that children whose mothers go out to work had a lower probability of gaining two or more A levels – but as in most other studies, these effects are very small relative to the much larger effects of socio-economic status and income. Rather than provoking a backlash against mothers’ employment, Joshi and Verropolou (2000) argue that these results underline the need for more flexible working conditions for families and for investment in high quality day care.

In one respect at least, maternal employment is undeniably beneficial, in that it brings, additional income and lifts many families out of poverty. Growing up in poverty has well-established links with later disadvantage.

A large body of research evidence points the same way: that the circumstances in which a child grows up have an enormous effect on later outcomes, in areas including education, income, employment, self-esteem and marital stability.
Assumption 2: Work life balance is only for women with children

Flexible working benefits everyone. It means no need to stereotype some people as a problem. Flexible working, open to all, reduces resentment about 'preferential treatment'.

Family life is coming first for many workers both male and female according to research by lastminute.com in 2006. Fathers are also eager to practice a work life balance to ensure quality time with their family. Working longer hours is no longer attractive even for extra money.

There are instances in Wales where in some households the husband or partner stays at home to care for the children while the female goes out to work. This is becoming increasingly the norm in many Scandinavian countries, and if the Work and Families Bill becomes a reality and paternity pay is realised then there is potential for this practice to become much more common throughout Wales.

Chwarae Teg's Work Life Balance Pilot Project worked with employers across Wales piloting initiatives for all staff to balance their work and home lives. The project found that initially staff had preconceived ideas about flexible working being for parents only, however, as the project progressed it became apparent that all staff were able to reap the benefits of new initiatives.

The project demonstrated that work life balance practices work most effectively when led by example. Managers were therefore encouraged to change their working patterns from the long hours culture to taking time off to spend with their families or enjoy hobbies. The project succeeded in changing cultures in these workplaces where work life balance is now embraced by all staff as an opportunity to manage stress, promote health and well-being and balance work with a happy home life.
**Assumption 3: Women and lone parents who are not working choose to be at home**

This is not necessarily true. Women and lone parents who are not in work or take a career break to care for their children/other dependent adults are classed as *economically inactive* rather than unemployed.

Some of them wish to work but find it difficult and others have chosen a career break and do not wish to work. According to research carried out by the International Labour Organisation (ILO) in 2005, approximately 25,000 women and 5,000 men in Wales (including lone parents) were not working because of adult/childcare responsibilities.

According to information three quarters of these women and men wanted to work but found it difficult for various reasons including: lack of skills and qualifications; lack of help and guidance and lack of accessible, affordable child care. It is also pertinent to add that many find themselves in the ‘benefits trap’, particularly lone parents. Those who claim Income Support and other benefits will find it difficult to work more than 16 hours a week without losing all benefits. This puts some lone parents in an impossible situation, where they want to work but rely on benefits to meet all their financial demands. Many lone parents choose not to work at all because of the fear of losing benefits in this way.

In the same way, those in further or higher education with student loans find that this is classed as an additional income, and they will lose entitlement to other benefits once they have received these loans.

Unfortunately many women and lone parents are stuck in the poverty trap, and without help and guidance will find it very difficult to re-enter the labour market. This is very often not their choice.
Assumption 4: poverty is not a significant issue in Wales these days

Welsh poverty rates have fallen faster than those in England and Scotland in the past ten years, however, one in four children continue to live in poor families and there are significant levels of poverty throughout the country, according to the Joseph Rowntree Foundation in their report on social exclusion in Wales. Roughly a third of the 170,000 children in homes below the poverty threshold lived in the Valleys, a third in Cardiff and the rest of the South, and a third in North, West and Mid Wales. More than half live with lone parents who are mostly not working. The report demonstrated that 640,000 people in Wales were living in poverty in 2005.

Low pay, especially among women is an increasingly significant cause of poverty in Wales. Despite minimum wage and tax credits, the numbers experiencing ‘in work poverty’ are no lower than in the mid 1990’s. According to the report one in four women in full-time employment and 60 per cent of those in part-time employment were paid less than £6.50 an hour, (25% of which were paid less than £5.00 an hour). Low pay was most prevalent in rural areas.

The family structure has considerable implications for children’s economic well-being, not least because lone parent families are at substantially higher risk of poverty than two-parent families. Lone parents are more likely than any other family type to be poor.

The Welsh Assembly Government in their Social Justice Report 2005 cited:

‘eradicating child poverty as a fundamental component of it’s strategy to improve quality of life and promote social inclusion and equal opportunities in every community in Wales’.


Research carried out by the Women’s Budget Group Women’s and children’s poverty: making the links in March 2005, demonstrated that tackling women’s poverty is critical to the long-term success of the present government child poverty strategy while also being significant in it’s own right.

---

27 Monitoring Poverty and Social Exclusion in Wales 2005, Joseph Rowntree Foundation
Research evidence and women’s testimonies in the report demonstrated that women are at greater risk of poverty than men, and more likely to suffer recurrent and longer spells in poverty. Women’s account of poverty illustrate that some black and minority ethnic group women may face particularly high poverty risks. Poor health and low morale all too often associated with hardship and the stress of managing poverty can have a damaging effect on a mother’s ability to seek and find paid work.

Women’s earnings – in both two and one-parent families – can play a crucial role in keeping their families out of poverty. To that end, any strategy that relies on paid work as the main route out of poverty therefore has to be explicitly gendered. This means that it has to include actions to address women’s disadvantage in the labour market and the various obstacles faced by low income mothers who want to take up work.

**Assumption 5: Women can’t really have it all**

This has been a raging debate for many years amongst men, employers and women themselves. As more women than ever are working and balancing family or other responsibilities with work and having a life of their own, it seems that they are wanting to have their cake and eat it, which is not on is it. Is it?

It is a sad reality in this day’s economy that many women don’t have the choice but to work full or part time in order to meet the financial demands of a family or other life commitments. Men’s salaries on their own are often not enough to sustain a household, and what about women living alone, lone parents or women in same sex partnerships where there is no male wage? Don’t they have the right to have it all as well if they want to? The cost of living will always be on the increase and the majority of women will choose to work because of this. However, we must not forget that many women also want to choose financial independence for themselves, or want a career of their own and an opportunity to fulfil their potential and achieve their personal goals.

Society is changing - more men are now equally taking the responsibility for childcare and household maintenance, some even choose to stay at home whilst their partners go out to work. Evidence suggests that more households than ever before depend on the female’s salary. If we live in the age of equality and men can have it all, then so can women if they have to, or want to – if that proves difficult then we to have the address the barriers that make society unequal and perpetuates the stereotypes.
Chapter 4

Survey Analysis and Focus Groups

Introduction

This chapter presents the research methods, an overview of findings, and the results and analysis of a survey conducted as part of the Cytgord research into the gender pay gap in Wales.

Research Methodology

In order to evaluate and review issues of the gender pay gap and gender stereotyping in the Welsh labour market, the survey process included:

- Sending initial correspondence letters requesting collaboration in the survey
- Distributing questionnaires to 7 target groups
- Conducting interviews/focus groups with representatives of the 7 target groups.

The seven target groups were selected due to their integral role in working towards closing the gender pay gap in Wales. The results included quantitative and qualitative data and information. In addition interviews and focus groups were also held to gather information.

Initial correspondence

Each target group received a bi-lingual initial letter outlining the nature and scope of the project, requesting their collaboration with the survey. Replies to the letters included a named contact and address for sending out the questionnaires.

The questionnaires

The questionnaires were sent out along with a covering letter explaining the aim of the survey and assuring confidentiality. Questionnaires were dispatched either by post or electronically on request. The questionnaires were available in Welsh and English, in large print and audiotape. Self-addressed envelopes were provided along with the option of faxing or e-
mailing replies. The questionnaires did not exceed 2-sided pages, with font, style and size chosen to ensure accessibility. The questionnaires were colour-coded for ease of data processing. Questions were funnelled for a thematic flow from section to section to focus on the key issues and recommendations. A cut-off date for receiving and processing the information was established.

Collection of Data and Information

Data and information was acquired from the 7 target groups specified as:

- Large Employers
- Small and Medium Enterprises
- Secondary Schools
- Primary Schools
- Individuals
- Education and Training Providers
- Children’s Information Services

Purpose of survey

Large, small and medium sized employers were targeted across Wales to ascertain their experience and views regarding the gender pay gap. Primary and secondary schools were contacted as education providers to identify barriers and any proactive approaches regarding challenging and eliminating gender stereotyping in schools and beyond. Circumstances and opinions of individuals were sought after to identify barriers experienced by male and female lone parents, those who were unemployed and those within education and training. Feedback from colleges and training providers were required to ascertain whether gender stereotyping in the employment market was influenced by gender traditional courses. Finally, Children’s services were approached to determine the main challenges of Work-Life Balance for those in employment, and to identify the current situation regarding childcare provision.

Questionnaire content

Questionnaires had common questions pertaining to all target groups as well as questions specific to a particular target group. The questionnaires were divided into sections to obtain facts, subject area information, experiences, thoughts and opinions, and role models of Good Practice. Each section was numbered, posing Closed and Open questions, to gather, respectively, both
quantitative and qualitative data. The questionnaires were also used as a basis for the interviews and focus group discussions.

Data analysis

Due to the small number of survey participants, quantitative data was subjected to simple statistical analysis. Content analysis was used to generate themes and trends from qualitative data collected.

Response rate

Responses were received from 95 of 462 questionnaires initially sent providing sample representation for all 7 groups targeted. The following table demonstrates the number of questionnaires sent to each category group and the percentage of responses returned. The chart below reveals representation made by each group to the survey analysis.

Table 1: Breakdown of Response Rates to Survey Questionnaires

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target Groups</th>
<th>Questionnaires Sent</th>
<th>Questionnaires Returned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Large Employers</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>13 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMEs</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>19 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary Schools</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>55 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Schools</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>43 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>17 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education &amp; Training Providers</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>11 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children’s Information Services</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>18 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Diagram 1: Target Group Representation
Demographic indicators

While this was an exploratory study we wanted to provide a snapshot of participants across Wales. The following graph demonstrates the sample make up and location by region of residence.

Diagram 2: Geographical Location of Respondents

Overview of Findings

Large Employers

Large employers that responded were predominantly public sector organisations that had existing equal opportunities policies. The legal implications of ensuring equality was among the main issues identified by large employers. Although companies employed a majority of female staff and flexible working practices were the norm, childcare facilities were found to be minimal. Nevertheless, many large employers were taking positive steps to overcome barriers to equality and recognised the benefits of doing so. In general, those responding on behalf of large employers demonstrated a clear understanding of the long term damaging effects of a gender pay gap on the Welsh economy and recommend both the adoption of policies involving job evaluation and equal pay audits, as well as cultural change and pro-active approaches in order to eliminate the gap.
Small Medium Enterprises (SMEs)

SME respondents employed a majority of male staff yet some women were represented at board level highlighting the growing entrepreneurship culture amongst women. Generally, findings indicated gender stereotyping problems where some SMEs highlighted an inability to attract prospective employees of an alternative gender. Findings revealed minimal work-life balance policies and flexible working arrangements. Additionally, there was no formal provision of childcare, which was deemed by most respondents as ‘unnecessary’. Results also revealed that responding SMEs had not conducted equal pay audits although they were aware that equality needs to include treating people equally, training equally and paying equally. Many had received specialist support in the development of equal opportunities policies from the former Welsh Development Agency. Those companies expressed that they rarely experienced issues relating to equality, and felt that they had no specific issues to deal with. SMEs demonstrated an awareness of the positive influences of ensuring equal opportunities, and a few that had made changes to policy and practice noted an increased awareness of the issues amongst staff.

Overall, SMEs were able to perceive the long-term negative impact of the gender pay gap on the Welsh economy and identified increased awareness, the education of staff and managers to the issues, legislative force, and financial support as aids to eliminating the perceived existing gap. The survey also demonstrated that SMEs could sometimes take pro-active approaches to address equality with less difficulty than large employers due to added flexibility and lower staff numbers.

Secondary Schools

The secondary schools who responded demonstrated an equal gender balance ratio, although teaching staff tended to be pre-dominantly female and the majority of Head Teachers male. Possessing a high awareness of the gender pay gap, most secondary schools had an equal opportunities policy and many also had an informal work-life balance policy. Findings revealed gender equality was generally a natural part of school ethos and promoting equal opportunities had a positive influence on schools as an important theme for both staff and pupils. Awareness of the issues was raised for pupils mostly through Personal Social (and Health) Education (PSHE), although morning service/assembly and the curriculum also contributed.
It was acknowledged by respondents that although schools and careers services attempted to tackle gender stereotyping when preparing pupils for employment, further joint-action was needed by education establishments, higher and further education colleges and employers.

**Primary Schools**

Primary schools that responded mainly employed female teaching staff. Findings revealed that usually equal opportunities policies were in place with some being revised to overcome barriers to equality with support from Local Education Authorities (LEAs). Respondents revealed an understanding of the positive influences of equal opportunities through active promotion of awareness amongst pupils by staff through day-to-day activities. However, primary schools generally felt that the current curriculum did not encourage pupils to consider non-traditional careers.

**Individuals**

The majority of individuals that responded lived in rural locations within Wales. Findings revealed a mixed profile including those who were self-employed, lone parents, unemployed and those in training or education. Individuals who had childcare responsibilities identified financial circumstances and balancing caring with working as barriers to career development. Career advice received at school was found to be minimal, irrelevant and gender biased. Current career development advice was identified as generally supportive and education and training courses accommodating to flexible study needs.

**Education and Training Providers**

Education and training providers that responded had adopted equal pay and family friendly policies. Efforts were made to ensure equality was embedded in every function yet a few respondents acknowledged difficulties in attracting men and women into some traditional areas of study. In order to enable women to fully participate in education, concerted efforts were being made by education and training providers to provide flexible teaching hours and access to and support with crèche facilities. Education and training providers were found to promote gender equality within the student community through equal opportunities policy and within course modules, although generally it was recognised that more could be done to ensure a greater gender balance on certain courses.
**Children’s Information Services**

Those within the children’s information services group targeted included multi-agency children’s partnerships and children’s information exchanges. These service providers experienced difficulties in supporting work-life balance due to a lack of suitably qualified staff, limited access to long-term funding, high levels of bureaucracy and overworking. Involved with numerous stakeholders and receiving no support from employers, they were found to be aware of the damaging effects that the gender pay gap was having on the Welsh economy and were concerned with the negative impact that shortages of qualified staff would have on the work-life balance agenda.

**Survey results and analysis**

**Large Employers**

Responses were predominantly received from public sector organisations with a sample representing the private sector. In all they included local authorities; police services; environmental organisations; health care trusts; housing associations and broadcast media providers.

**Statistics**

- 90% of large employer respondents were found to be led by a male manager
- On average respondents employed approximately 4000 staff, 64% female and 36% male
- Females accounted for approximately 18% of senior positions
- 82% were aware of the gender pay gap

**Equal Opportunities and Work-Life Balance Policies**

All respondents reported the existence of an Equal Opportunities policy and many had flexible working policies and practices in place. Childcare facilities were found to be minimal although some provided financial support or childcare vouchers for the early years.

**Main concerns regarding equality**

Ensuring gender equality was a concern for all large employer respondents. Some of the key issues identified directly relating to equality included:

- Equal pay
• Equal access to pension schemes
• Terms and conditions of service for all staff
• Recruitment and retention
• Access to training

Equal Pay claims and audits

Most respondents had not experienced any discrimination issues within the company regarding equal pay, however there was a general awareness of the financial consequences of equal pay claims.

Although some had conducted informal equal pay audits or were currently undergoing informal audits, the majority of respondents had never conducted an equal pay audit.

Overcoming barriers to equality and equal pay

On the whole large employers that responded had taken a number of actions to overcome barriers to equality in the workplace. These included:

• Equal pay audits and job evaluation schemes
• Adopting flexible working policies and accommodating working arrangements such as flexible working hours
• Home working
• Providing carers leave and giving staff the opportunity to purchase additional leave
• Developing and reviewing equal opportunities policies

The effects of actions taken to overcome barriers to equal pay (and equality) had been found by respondents to be very positive. The impacts recorded were:

• Improving the image of the organisations
• Aiding staff retention
• Reducing sickness absence
• Reducing recruiting costs and staff turnover
• Being recognised as an employer of choice

Support received and required to develop equal opportunities policies

Equal opportunities policies of respondents were predominantly developed in-house as shown in the chart below. Most large employers did not require
external support regarding equality and equal pay, as they felt sufficiently self-supported internally.

Diagram 3: Support Received in the Development of Equal Opportunities Policy

Equal Opportunity Policy Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% of Large Employers</th>
<th>Support Received</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In House</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultants</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equalities Groups</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Influences of equal opportunity on Large Employers**

73% of large employers acknowledged that equal opportunity had had a positive influence citing examples such as raised awareness for managers and staff and noting financial and diversity benefits. When asked to provide a message for other companies considering equality in the workplace one large employer put it succinctly:

“Equality of pay, a structured process for measuring relative worth of roles and responsibilities is essential”.

**Eliminating the gender pay gap in Wales**

Respondents identified the main long-term effects of the gender pay gap on the Welsh economy to be:

- Social disadvantage, inequality and poverty particularly for lone parent families and women returning to work
- An inability to fill certain types of jobs
Suggestions on how to eliminate the pay gap included:

- The adoption of policies involving equal pay audits and job evaluation
- Cultural change and positive action

**Small Medium Enterprises (SMEs)**

Industries represented within the SME respondents included:

- Food retail and catering
- Information Communication Technology
- Building contractors
- Social care providers
- Manufacturing and manufacturing support and retail services

**Statistics**

- 57% of SMEs surveyed were managed by a man, with 29% by a woman and 14% involving both men and women
- On average SMEs that responded employed 21 staff and the gender ratio was dominated by male employees where the average gender ratio was 64% male and 36% female
- 72% of the SMEs were aware of the gender pay gap in Wales

**Equal Opportunities and Work-Life Balance Policies**

All respondents reported the existence of an equal opportunities policy yet only a few reported a formal work-life balance policy. There was no provision of childcare or crèche facilities by those companies who participated in the survey with some noting that current staff did not require childcare support.
Main equality concerns

Table 2: Main Issues Regarding Equality for SMEs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Percentage of SME’s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Treating people equally</td>
<td>38 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring equal pay</td>
<td>21 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision of training</td>
<td>21 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring fair working conditions (including work life balance)</td>
<td>8 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accommodating childcare arrangements</td>
<td>8 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging more females into traditionally male occupations</td>
<td>4 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One respondent stated:

“We have always provided equal pay / equal training opportunities, equal work-life balance opportunities and (have) gone out of our way to accommodate childcare arrangements”.

Equal Pay claims and issues

The SMEs who responded did not conduct equal pay audits and had never experienced issues or complaints regarding equal pay. This may have been due to numerous factors that are common to SMEs including:

- Limited resources (such as time and finance and know-how) to conduct such audits
- A lack of awareness by managers and staff of the reality of inequality in pay
- Restricted channels for dispute by staff

Overcoming barriers to equality

Few SMEs identified any equality concerns within their companies, this could have been due to support previously provided by the SME Equality Project. With regard to gender stereotyping one respondent acknowledged:

“a lack of women in the industry. As a company we have adopted new employment policies to try to be more attractive to prospective female employees”.
Those SMEs that had made changes in company policy to improve equality had noticed an increased interest by prospective employees and increased staff awareness of equality rights.

**Support received and required to develop equal opportunities policies**

The next chart demonstrates that 63% of SMEs had received Welsh Assembly Government support to develop equal opportunity policies. Further assistance with the provision of paternity leave and information regarding latest legislation were requested to enable further policy development.

![Diagram 4: Support Received for Equal Opportunity Policy Development](image)

**Influences of equal opportunity on SMEs**

68% of SMEs that responded noted the positive influence of equal opportunity, some 29% of respondents could not perceive an effect or determine its influence as either positive or negative. Messages from SMEs for those considering equality in the workplace demonstrated an awareness of the positive effects of equal opportunity:

> “Companies can only benefit from having larger pools of prospective employees to choose from. Once employed, all staff will feel happier and therefore more motivated in an environment where they feel they are treated fairly.”
Responding SMEs were able to perceive the long-term negative impact of the gender pay gap on the Welsh economy particularly identifying a potential reduction in competitiveness and the loss of valuable skills. Respondents also identified the negative impact on firms including disharmony in the workplace, financial loss and a de-motivated female workforce. Respondents suggested a need for increased awareness, the education of staff and managers to the issues, legislative force and the provision of financial support in order to eliminate the gender pay gap.

**Secondary Schools**

**Statistics**

- Secondary schools that responded employed an average of 57 teaching staff, of which 54% were female and 46% male
- 58% had male Head Teachers
- 17% did not have female representation at Head or Deputy Head level
- 92% were aware of the gender pay gap

The following Welsh counties were represented:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Counties represented (alphabetical order)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blaenau Gwent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carmarthenshire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ceredigion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conwy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flintshire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gwynedd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neath Port Talbot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Powys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhondda Cynon Taf</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Equal Opportunities and Work-Life Balance Policies**

92% of the secondary schools had an equal opportunities policy. 33% had some sort of work-life balance policy either formal or informal, currently in progress or as part of the Teachers’ Workload Agreement.

**Main concerns regarding equality**

Secondary school respondents were primarily concerned with the following equality issues:

- Childcare
- Recruitment
- Flexible working, part time working and job share
Maternity and paternity leave
• Attracting male role models
• Recruitment of teaching staff of particular genders for some subjects

**Equal Pay claims and issues**

The majority of respondents had not conducted equal pay audits. Equal pay audits that had been conducted resulted in men and women with the same responsibilities receiving the same wages.

**Overcoming barriers to equality**

Many respondents attempted to provide flexible working and part-time arrangements within the restraints of timetabling and the curriculum to overcome barriers to equality but few had formal policies in place to ensure equality of treatment.

**Influences of equal opportunity on Secondary Schools**

75% of secondary schools reported that equal opportunity had a positive influence on the school, identifying it as:

“an important theme for pupils and staff”

**Awareness of gender equality amongst pupils**

In order to raise awareness, schools were found to generally use the Personal Social Education Plan. Responsibility for educating pupils on the various aspects of equality was the general responsibility of the teacher in charge of the scheme within the school. Others used Personal, Social and Health Education (PSHE) where the Head of PSHE would be responsible for ensuring that all such issues are covered.

Other awareness raising methods identified included the provision of activities available to everyone (i.e. football for girls), through the curriculum and lesson content, work experience, careers guidance and lessons, outside speakers and occupational courses available to both sexes.

Schools requested support to overcome barriers to equality amongst pupils through ‘exemplars in action at other schools’ and guest speakers.
Eliminating the gender pay gap in Wales

In order to eliminate gender inequality in Wales, respondents from secondary schools suggested that:

- Pupils be encouraged to choose suitable career paths without worrying about gender stereotypes
- Pupils be educated of equality issues
- Universities, colleges and employers should contribute towards educating pupils
- A wide curriculum be provided to eradicating stereotyping
- Student engagement be encouraged through curricular and extra curricular experiences and activities.

With regard to subject choice and careers, secondary schools were found to tackle gender stereotyping when preparing pupils for work through careers lessons, guidance and mentoring activities. Assistance to do so was obtained through support schemes such as Women into Science and Engineering and Construction (WISE), Young Enterprise, Reaching Higher, Careers Wales and PSHE.

Deterring gender stereotyping in career choice

There were mixed opinions as to whether the current curriculum encourages pupils to consider pursuing non-traditional careers. Some respondents believed the Schools Inspectorate encourages the acceptance of typically male / female subjects and careers. Others argued that there exists plenty of opportunity for girls and boys to choose from a wide variety of subjects in each key stage. Finally, some regarded the curriculum to be neutral of career choice suggesting that the advice given through careers guidance and PSHE is intended to widen pupils’ horizons in this respect.
Diagram 5: Opinions Regarding the Role of the Curriculum in Encouraging Pursuit of Non-Traditional Careers.

Does the Current Curriculum Encourage Pupils to Consider Non-Traditional Careers?

- Yes 33%
- No 33%
- No Opinion 25%
- Curriculum is Neutral 9%

Primary Schools

Statistics

- Based on the responses, primary schools employ 8 teaching staff on average, of which 78% were female and 22% male
- 61% of Head Teachers were found to be female, the remaining 39% male. All respondents reported 1 Deputy Head Teacher in post, 63% of whom female
- 57% of respondents were aware of the gender pay gap

The following Welsh counties were represented:

Table 4: Counties represented (alphabetical order)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Blaenau Gwent</th>
<th>Denbighshire</th>
<th>Newport</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bridgend</td>
<td>Gwynedd</td>
<td>Pembrokeshire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Camarthenshire</td>
<td>Merthyr Tydfil</td>
<td>Powys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ceredigion</td>
<td>Monmouthshire</td>
<td>Rhondda Cynon Taf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conwy</td>
<td>Neath Port Talbot</td>
<td>Swansea</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Equal Opportunities and Work-Life Balance Policies

100% of primary school respondents had an equal opportunities policy in place. 28% did not have a work-life balance policy and the remaining responses were unclear.
Main concerns regarding equality

The main concern regarding equality was the recruitment of male primary school teachers yet 56% of respondents did not consider gender equality to be a concern.

Equal Pay claims and issues

All schools confirmed that there had never been an issue within the school regarding equal pay and only 6% had conducted equal pay audits.

Policy development

In order to overcome barriers to inequality, primary schools were found to be revising policies or introducing new ones with support from Local Education Authorities and Local Authorities.

Influences of equal opportunity on Primary Schools

50% of primary schools deemed equal opportunity to be a positive influence on the school. A message applicable to both staff and students was used within one primary school:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E</th>
<th>Equal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q</td>
<td>Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U</td>
<td>Undivided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>All</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td>Lifetime</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Awareness of gender equality amongst pupils

Awareness raising was identified as being the responsibility of staff, Head Teachers, school governors, Local Education Authorities, Personal Social Education Coordinators, and everyone.

Methods used to raise awareness of equality amongst primary school pupils:

- Provision of the same opportunities relating to sports, games and projects
- Awareness raising during assembly
- Personal Social Education
- Challenging of stereotypes by staff
• Treating girls and boys the same
• Equal opportunity in every area possible and no unnecessary differentiation

_Deterring gender stereotyping in career choice_

Despite recent changes to do so, the majority of primary school respondents did not consider the current curriculum to encourage pupils to consider non-traditional careers.

_Diagram 6: Opinions Regarding the Role of the Curriculum in Encouraging Pursuit of Non-Traditional Careers._

![Pie chart showing opinions on the current curriculum encouraging non-traditional careers: 47% No, 33% Yes, 20% No Opinion.]

_Eliminating the gender pay gap in Wales_

A powerful recommendation was made by one respondent in particular who identified a need for strong local policies, the raising of expectations of all groups, and the tackling of discrimination through raised awareness.

_Individuals_

The table below reveals the counties represented by individuals that responded to the questionnaire. The majority of whom were within rural locations as shown in the chart below.

_Table 5: Counties Represented (alphabetical order)_

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cardiff</th>
<th>Denbighshire</th>
<th>Pembrokeshire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Carmarthenshire</td>
<td>Gwynedd</td>
<td>Port Talbot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ceredigion</td>
<td>Newport</td>
<td>Swansea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conwy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Current situation of Individuals

Individuals that responded to the survey included lone parents, self-employed, unemployed and students. The majority of whom were lone parents currently unemployed within education or training. In all, 64% of respondents were found to be lone parents. The chart below reveals the profiles of individuals that responded.
Unemployment and obstacles in returning to work

46% of non-working respondents had been out of work for less than six months as demonstrated in the chart below.

![Diagram 9: Period of Time Out of Employment](chart.png)

Period of Time Out of Employment

- Less than 6 months: 46%
- More than 6 months: 18%
- More than 12 months: 9%
- Other: 27%

Individuals gave the following reasons for being out of work:

- Lack of suitable work and opportunities
- Lack of own transport
- Financially impossible to work and study
- Unemployment due to short term and temporary contracts ending
- Previous bleak career prospects within employment

Obstacles in returning to work were identified as:

- Lack of opportunities that enable work within school time hours
- Travel
- Care of small children

Help required to return to work was identified as:

- Sourcing of suitable post with reasonable wage
- Shorter working days to accommodate ‘the school run’
- After school and out of school clubs
- Own transport
- Not considering a student loan as an income when assessing housing benefit
- Financial support for study
Career development and advice

Findings suggest individuals feel that they have to learn or earn to develop a career but finances and responsibility of children are barriers to achieving this.

Respondents considered support from schools to help individuals choose careers to be minimal taking the form of short interviews, careers questionnaires and careers lessons during visits by advisors. Other respondents commented that there was very little help and advice when they were in school and any career advice given was gender stereotyped, for example women were advised to consider a nursing or secretarial career and were not informed of the occupational potential of male dominated industries. Several respondents provided examples of unsuitable career advice that did not take pupil interest into account.

“Girls should not be channelled into typically female roles.”

65% of respondents felt they had not received any career advice or support beyond school with regard to their career development. Those that did named Jobcentre / Jobcentre Plus, New Deal 50 plus and Prospects.

Respondents identified several matters that would have better facilitated their career aspirations. These included more career guidance and advice at school, and better knowledge of what to expect, not only in terms of work experience but also what to expect along career paths.

Flexibility of working arrangements

21% of the individuals that responded were employed. They did not identify the presence of flexible working arrangements or indicate levels of support given by employers to ease work-life balance.

Education and training

Individuals within education or training identified their study methods as flexible and recognised support given by lecturers and institutions in contributing to this:

“There are set timetables but tutors are keen to help you catch up if you miss a lecture”
100% of individuals within education and training did not consider that they had been treated less favourably in their educational establishment because of their gender although those who were studying non-traditional areas did find it particularly challenging.

Further financial assistance was identified as the main factor in making learning easier including access to interest free loans and financial support to learn and help with supporting a family.

**Education and Training Providers**

**Statistics**

- 75% of respondents were located in North Wales and 25% Mid Wales
- 75% of respondents had a Male Principle / Chief Executive
- 75% of respondents were aware of the gender pay gap in Wales
- The average number of staff employed was found to be 744, of which 58% female and 42% male as shown in the chart below:

![Diagram 10: Staff Gender Ratio of Education and Training Providers](image)

**Equal opportunities and work-life balance**

Education and training providers that responded generally had equal pay and family friendly policies in place. 50% of respondents did not provide crèche facilities, 25% did, and another 25% issued childcare vouchers.

**Main concerns regarding gender equality**

50% of respondents considered gender equality to be an issue of concern within their organisations:
Main concerns of education and training providers as employers regarding equality included equal pay in general, keeping up with changing legislation, implementing/modernising equal pay policies, and undertaking job evaluations and pay reviews.

**Equal pay claims and issues**

100% of respondents had not experienced any issues within the college or training organisation regarding equal pay and 75% had not conducted equal pay audits. Those that did conduct equal pay audits had done so through the All Wales Project resulting in further development and review of policies.

**Overcoming barriers to equality**

The majority of respondents did not receive any support or help to develop equal opportunities policies. Yet in order to overcome barriers for staff, education and training providers were found to be introducing, updating and reviewing policies and procedures to ensure equality. Efforts were being made to ensure prospective employment applications from both genders through family friendly policies and flexible arrangements such as part time working, job sharing, short-term working and flexible working. The effects of changes identified included increased transparency and equal pay, increased applicants for vacancies and improved staff retention.

Suggestions for support beneficial to the college or organisation with regard to equality and equal pay included improved systems and practices:

- Development of a work-life balance policy
- Management training in Good Practice
- Increased availability of courses where equality issues are embedded
- A single implementation date for equal opportunities legislation, one policy that covers all areas

**Influence of equal opportunity on Education and Training Providers**

Equal opportunity was identified as having a positive influence on responding education and training providers. It was acknowledged that:
Education and training providers that responded to the questionnaire acknowledged difficulty in encouraging men and women into some non-traditional fields (e.g. women into engineering and lack of men into care). The main recruitment issues for respondents were identified as bilingualism and good marketing to all. To enable women to fully participate in education and training, respondents were found to provide support through contingency funds towards crèche fees, flexible teaching hours to allow students with caring responsibilities to attend during school hours and access to higher education courses.

With regard to the student community, education and training providers were found to promote gender equality through equal opportunities policies and practice within course modules.

**Children’s Services**

As shown in the chart below, this target group was represented by:

- Children’s Information Services - who provide information regarding childcare, children and young people’s services
- Multi-agency children’s partnerships - which assist in the development of local council agendas for children and young people by providing direction and leadership.

![Diagram 11: Responses from Children’s Information Services](image)

Children’s information services were found to identify lack of childcare provision as a major issue thus creating barriers to the work-life balance of parents because of:

- Shortages of sustainable childcare in some areas
- Shortages of unsociable hours childcare
• Shortages of Welsh Medium childcare
• Shortages of suitable childcare for ages 11-14yrs
• High costs of childcare
• Problems in funding suitably qualified staff to work in rural areas

One respondent put it succinctly:

“The work-life balance agenda cannot be taken forward if more childcare workers cannot be found.”

In addition to provision of childcare, children’s services were found to be struggling with strategic issues:

• Children’s information exchanges experienced difficulty in accessing long term funding
• Multi-agency children’s partnerships found it difficult to manage the numerous initiatives existing and the breadth and complexity of the work.

To better facilitate their work, multi-agency children’s partnerships identified further Welsh Assembly Government support and improved collaboration between partners as strategically necessary. It was explained that support from the Welsh Assembly Government was needed to:

• Implement reduced bureaucracy and enable local decision making on how to do the job
• Join up thinking at Assembly level as too many initiatives are not connected together
• Present stronger directions regarding some of the key strategic partnerships and how they should work together, i.e. Health, Social Care and Well Being, Safeguarding Boards and the Partnerships

Additionally, multi-agency children’s partnerships required improved relationships and collaborative working with partnership members. Respondents felt there was a need for partnership members to facilitate:

• Greater identification with the partnership so that members consider themselves as the Partnership and not separate from it
• Greater willingness to be influenced around funding and budgets
Findings reveal that an increase in the number of childcare providers and an all Wales work-life balance initiative would better facilitate the work of Children’s Services.

Children’s services organisations that responded considered the effects of the pay gap on the Welsh economy to result in:

“loss of valuable, trained workforce from Wales. Difficulty in attracting employers to relocate to Wales without a skilled workforce”.

Recommendations and Conclusions

Responses to the questionnaires provided recommendations made by the target groups. These included ways in which to move forward in eliminating the gender pay gap in Wales and equality organisation’s role in doing so; actions to reduce occupational segregation; and ways in which work-life balance in Wales can be improved.

Eliminating the gender pay gap in Wales

- Large employers recommended the implementation of policies involving equal pay audits and job evaluation, and in contrast SMEs identified methods to address equality in a flexible manner including the education of staff and managers and accommodating individuals needs

- Schools and education and training providers called for further education of school children of equality issues, the tackling of discrimination through raised awareness and increased equality issues within training modules.

Equality organisation’s role in eliminating the gender pay gap in Wales

- Large employers recommended that organisations like Chwarae Teg provide continued encouragement and support, the highlighting of issues and further questioning of why equal pay in is not being achieved in Wales

- Taking into account that Chwarae Teg was established to promote the economic development of women, SMEs suggested that Chwarae Teg should work towards eliminating the gender pay gap between men and women through highlighting the issue in order to increase awareness
particularly at a governmental level and provide financial incentives to businesses to ensure women are supported

- Education and training providers recommended that Chwarae Teg campaign for the Welsh Assembly to place equal pay audits high on the agenda as essential and not optional

- Children’s services recommended that Chwarae Teg continue to encourage new childcare providers to set up in business and provide financial support to existing providers for further business development.

**Occupational Segregation**

In order to tackle occupational segregation, gender stereotyping in career choice needs to be minimised.

- Respondents from secondary schools suggested that pupils be encouraged to choose suitable career paths without worrying about gender stereotypes

- Universities, colleges and employers contribute towards educating pupils in secondary schools, and student engagement be encouraged through the curriculum and extra curricular experiences and activities.

- Individuals believed that in order to help women/ single parents / men fulfil their career potential; Chwarae Teg should “be there and be supportive”

- Assistance for individuals negotiating the complex path through getting enrolled on courses / organising childcare, obtaining finance etc was requested to enable individuals to work towards a career of choice.

**Work-Life Balance**

Children’s services identified that to enable further development of the work-life balance agenda in Wales more qualified childcare providers are necessary. In particular multi-agency children’s partnerships identified shortages of qualified staff and recommended that schools be allowed access to grants for staff training costs in the same way that playgroups and out of school childcare clubs could to increase the number of qualified staff across both sectors. In order to achieve this, funding from the Welsh Assembly Government would be needed and changes implemented by the Local Education Authorities or schools.
Conclusion

This useful exercise has enabled a better understanding and insight into the current situation of the gender pay gap in Wales amongst employers, training and education providers, individuals and other relevant organisations. By examining their views and opinions, experiences and challenges we have been able to map the good practice already in place and identify the key barriers that still exist.

We have found that in general increased public awareness and improved partnership working is needed to tackle discrimination and improve the pay gap. Individuals require continued encouragement and support in order to overcome barriers to career development, and improved childcare provision is needed throughout Wales. Children’s Information Services need further resources to enable them to provide enhanced support to individuals and to enable them to work more closely with employers to influence to work life balance agenda. Schools require equality to be firmly embedded in the schools curriculum and suggest further joint-action to reduce potential occupational segregation. Furthermore employers require business development advice and support to enable them to implement positive changes and mainstream equality effectively.

Finally, the survey demonstrates that some progress has indeed been made over the last 30 years, yet there is still a long way to go to tackle some of the fundamental key issues that contribute to the existence of a gender pay gap in Wales.
5.1 Gender Mainstreaming

What is gender mainstreaming?

Incorporating equality into policies and services has created a common language across Europe under the banner of mainstreaming. The concept of gender mainstreaming and equality mainstreaming was introduced into our language during the United Nations Third World Conference on Women in Nairobi in 1985. Lack of clarity around the term mainstreaming led to the EU producing a conceptual framework for gender mainstreaming as a strategy for the promotion of equality between women and men.

Cytgord defines mainstreaming as a long-term process that encompasses the normal ideas, attitudes or activities of society. It is a process where those ideas, attitudes or activities routinely incorporate a gender perspective and become a normal feature of mainstream thinking. It essentially means that policy makers, employers and those delivering services should take account of and reflect the diverse needs of the population in Wales. Policy makers, employers and education and training providers need to understand that different communities and groups face particular inequalities and difficulties. With this in mind, it is essential to consider how the policies and projects that are developed in Wales, impact upon these communities and groups.

Mainstreaming is about including consideration for equality and diversity in all aspects of:

- policy planning and development
- education and training provision
- employment practices
- service provision
- project management
Equality should not be considered as a bolt on – that is something that is thought of after a policy has been developed - it needs to be part of any process right from the start. This is the only way that equality can be embedded into everything that we do.

**Why do we need do it?**

If we mainstream equality right from the start of any process it avoids discrimination from the outset, or having to make costly changes or adjustments later on when a policy or practice has already been implemented. Mainstreaming has also been proved to drive innovation, by ensuring a diverse and representative workforce.

Without ensuring mainstreaming, policies and practices will continue to exclude and discriminate against some groups in society. Their full potential will not be realised and they will not be able to equally participate in society. This leads to wasted opportunities and talent in the labour market, and contributes to the gender pay gap.

**How do we do it?**

For existing polices and practice one of the first things to be to done is an equality proofing exercise. This is a process that identifies the beneficial aspects of policies and practices for groups that are discriminated against in society. For example, a gender proofing exercise will consist of recognising the differences between the needs of men and women, taking these differences into account and taking measures to tackle any inequalities that are identified. Gender proofing is based on solid analysis of the current situation with, where possible, the use of statistics and scientific data. This ensures that the policies and practice are not based on incorrect assumptions and stereotypes. Where an existing policy or practice results in inequality, albeit unintentionally, the gender proofing process investigates the situation until the root cause of the inequality is established and remedial action identified.

If a company is developing new processes and policies it is an excellent opportunity to build in aspects that ensure that everyone is included. This will ensure that any potential inequalities are avoided from the outset. Ensuring equality does not always have cost implications - very often just minor adjustments can make a whole load of difference. Specialist advice and guidance is available on how to mainstream effectively.
5.2 Pro-active approaches

What is a pro-active approach?

When inequalities have been identified within a company, education or training establishment or within policy, sometimes it is necessary to take action to address the issues by being pro-active. Pro-active approaches can also be taken to avoid inequalities or discrimination taking place. These actions can include implementing a specific project, undertaking research, making assessments or audits, or even running a training programme. The most successful pro-active approaches tend to be innovative and empowering for all involved.

Examples of pro-active approaches

The following are examples of pro-active approaches that can be taken by organisations - they are by no means prescriptive.

Policy development

The Government of Wales Act, Section 120 is a unique piece of legislation as it enforces the Welsh Assembly Government to take responsibility for equality mainstreaming throughout all areas of policy development and operational activities. Everything that is developed, implemented and evaluated needs to reflect the requirements within this Act. Equality organisations across Wales welcome this policy as a key driver for working towards equality in all aspects of economic and social life in Wales.

Gender Impact Assessments

This is a tool that can be used to undertake gender proofing. It is a technique that should be used even before policies have been drafted and is an effective method of ensuring that policies and subsequent practices are not discriminating against women and lone parents in any form. This technique can also be used to undertake general equality impact assessments.

Most gender impact assessments are however, undertaken after policies or provisions have already been implemented. Even though this can still prove effective, it is best to conduct an assessment prior to developing new policies or practices. Assessments can be statistical, strategic or operational, or even include all of these areas.
There are usually five steps to a successful gender impact assessment. These are:

Step One  - identify the issues and define the outcomes  
Step Two  - collect data 
Step Three - communicate 
Step Four  - deliver 
Step Five   - monitor and evaluate 

Gender budgeting

Gender budgeting is a way of measuring to what degree men and women benefit from spending programmes. The Equal Opportunities Commission, Chwarae Teg, and Oxfam have been promoting this approach in Wales for a few years. In the past gender budgeting has been used as an analysis of government budgets to establish the different impacts of revenue or expenditure on men and women, but it can be applied to all forms of funding. This process is already being used around the globe.

Budgets are most important as they reflect the spending choices a government or organisation makes to achieve aims and objectives. A gender budget approach does not aim to produce a separate budget for men and women, but to analyse expenditure or resource allocation from a gender perspective. This mechanism can be effective through budget planning, objective setting and monitoring and evaluation.

The Wales Gender Budget Group is an independent network bringing together people from a range of organisations that have a common interest in gender equality. The Group aims to promote gender equality in Wales through the effective use of gender budget tools in any policy decision-making process. This Group has made recommendations to the Welsh Assembly Government to build gender budgeting into the monitoring process of the Gender Equality Duty in preparation for it's implementation in 2007.

Equal pay audits

Employers are encouraged to undertake equal pay audits in order to identify any inequalities within the workplace in relation to:

- pay and conditions
- promotion and career prospects
• pensions and company benefits

The Equal Opportunities Commission in conjunction with the TUC and the former Welsh Development Agency developed an Equal Pay Toolkit for large and small employers, which guides them through the audit process.

Once inequalities have been identified measures can then be put in place to address issues and mainstream effectively. This of course can also avoid any pay discrimination cases being brought against the employer.

Mainstreaming Reviews

These are usually carried out on major policy areas or governmental departments. They aim to assess the impact of current mainstreaming practices or identify gaps in policy areas where mainstreaming is not being addressed.

The National Assembly for Wales undertook a Mainstreaming Equality Policy Review in 2004. The purpose of this review was to consider how equality could be mainstreamed into the work of the National Assembly for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government. The recommendations of the review included:

• Developing an equality overarching strategy
• Demonstrating equality mainstreaming good practice
• Ensuring that action is taken across all divisional political portfolios
• Undertaking data and strategy audit
• Adopting a recruitment strategy that reflects equality and diversity
• Increasing the diversity of the Executive Board
• Deliver equality training for Assembly Members
• Conducting consultations with a wide range of individuals
• Putting gender needs assessment at the heart of community development
• Piloting gender budgeting in a policy area

Campaigns

Campaigns are often very successful in highlighting key issues and gaining support for causes in order to influence action. They usually involve production of literature, conferences and public gatherings.
Campaigns in Wales are mostly run by national organisations for maximum impact and have proved successful in raising the profile of the gender pay gap issue amongst other relevant equality issues.

**Case Study 1 – Close the Pay Gap Campaign**

The *Close the Pay Gap* Campaign was a pro-active approach to promoting equal pay amongst the public sector in Wales. It was a collaborate approach between the Equal Opportunities Commission; the Trade Union Congress and the Welsh Assembly Government. An Equal Pay Summit was held in October 2005 and was chaired by the Minister for Equal Opportunities. Key decisions makers from the public sector reported on progress in their sectors and considered ways of tackling the barriers and issues to achieving equal pay. Four common issues were explored:

- risk
- priority
- capacity
- funding

A strong message emerged regarding the need for increased collaboration and sharing of best practice across the public sector. The Summit was the beginning of a 12 month intensive action plan. All public sector organisations were contacted and requested to sign up to equal pay commitments and identify specific actions plans for their sectors. The campaign partners then agreed the best way to assist organisations to achieve their objectives.

The Close the Pay gap campaign has:

- encouraged a number of employers in the public sector to carry out equal pay reviews
- led trade unions in Wales to place a renewed focus on discrimination in pay systems, notably through the provision of training for union managers and officials
- given examples of case studies documenting the experience of employers who have carried out equal pay reviews
- provided examples of good practice to share with other employers
- targeted information to the private sector and brought national media attention to the issue
Case Study 2 - The SME Equality Project

The Welsh Assembly Government’s Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks’ (formerly the Welsh Development Agency) SME Equality Project was established in 1998 as a response to a recognised need to counteract the material barriers faced by women when accessing employment. The project has worked with over 2,000 Small and Medium Sized Enterprises (SME) through specialist advisors who work with SME’s delivering tailored solutions around equality and diversity. The SME’s benefited from best practice as well as compliance with current legislation, the Project focused on: gender, race, disability, sexual orientation, Welsh language, size, age, social class, religion and belief.

Since its inception, the SME Equality project has been actively involved in reducing the gender pay gap in Wales, both individually and in partnership with the Equal Opportunities Commission Wales. The Project also works closely with the Commission for Racial Equality, Disability Rights Commission, Stonewall Cymru and Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service (ACAS), the NHS Equality Unit in Wales.

The Project was delivered to the individual SME’s by a body of independently contracted business advisors. These specialists have each demonstrated their expertise in equality and diversity development and in terms of the consultancy process itself. During the course of their development work with SME’s, the advisors collected supporting evidence of the existing gender pay gap in Welsh businesses. This evidence, gathered along with company background details and testimonials from business owners who have actively participated, was assimilated by the Project and used to promote gender equality to other SME’s through the production of case studies. Testimonials and comments received from the businesses allowed the advisors to re-visit the companies to develop examples of best practice and produce case studies that could be used as an aid to publicise the Project’s work.

Evidence of the existing gender pay gap, is utilised by the Project when presenting the case for gender equality to the Welsh Assembly Government and other policy making bodies. By helping to combat attitudes on a legislative level, the Project was achieving its aim of bringing down the constraints on women’s employment choices and the differences in working patterns. In addition to work instigated by the Project itself, contributions were made to working groups from larger equality organisations. The Project’s involvement with other groups and work life balance yielded a host of positive arguments for gender equality and equal pay.
Case Study 3 – The European Equality Partnership

The European Equality Partnership was established in 1997. It was set up with European funding to increase the equal opportunities profile within the European Funding Programmes through awareness raising and training. The partnership members included representatives from: Chwarae Teg, The Equal Opportunities; the former Welsh Development Agency, Commission for Racial Equality, Disability Rights Commission, Disability Wales, Wales Council for Voluntary Action, and the Welsh European Funding Office (Welsh Assembly Government).

The European Equality Partnership was responsible for campaigning for the inclusion of other equality issues in addition to gender to be incorporated into the Wales strategic documentation for the European Structural Funds. The Partnership was also instrumental in compiling the equal opportunities cross cutting theme chapters of the strategic documents, with an emphasis on gender mainstreaming.

Two sets of comprehensive equality guidance were written by the Partnership and distributed to project planners, managers and assessors throughout Wales. These guidelines were also used widely in relevant areas of the UK and Europe. Representatives of Chwarae Teg were invited to numerous UK and European conference to discuss the good practice being developed by the Partnership in Wales and to promote the guidelines.

All Wales equality training events were delivered to appropriate personnel, national bodies and project partnerships throughout Wales, and a European conference was held in Wales to celebrate success and progress future development.

A UK/Irish network of gender mainstreaming experts and specialists was launched by the Partnership in conjunction with Ireland’s Government Gender Equality Unit in 2003. A website for this project was launched in 2004 and remains active.

The European Equality Partnership played an integral role in the monitoring and evaluation of the 2000-2006 funding programmes in Wales, and have recently made recommendations for the preparation of the new programmes in 2007.

While the partnership still exists funding for future activities has now ceased.
Case Study 4 – Work Life Balance Pilot Project

This project was run by Chwarae Teg over a period of 3 years, sponsored by the Welsh Assembly Government. The organisations involved in the pilot projects were large sponsored organisations such as two local authorities, two assembly-sponsored bodies and a university. Therefore, work life balance was included on the equality agenda and rolled-out as a tool to promote equality by respecting everyone’s wish for different working patterns; as an aid to enhance/increase service delivery; to assist with recruitment and retention issues, and to reduce sickness/absence (particularly ad-hoc absence).

The project focused on mainstreaming work life balance and sending the message that EVERYONE had a right to a healthy work life balance regardless of their personal circumstances. Having support from third party organisations and in-house union representatives proved very beneficial.

The impact on employers was that they were able to offer a better service; staff were happier and more motivated and less likely to leave. Recruitment costs were halved in one organisation over one 12 month period and sickness absence improved over 30%. Across all projects, staff turnover reduced from an already relatively healthy 7.6% (compared to 13.5% for local government as a whole) to 4.1% in the calendar year of 2004.

The project also resulted in those organisations’ greater ability to balance childcare and work responsibilities, through use of home-working, and other flexible working arrangements including:

- purchase of additional leave
- flexible working hours
- term-time working
- compressed hours working
- phased return from maternity leave
- annualised hours

Feedback from staff demonstrated a new commitment to their organisations for recognising that they need a healthy work life balance.

However, there were feelings that when the pilot officers had finished their work the momentum was threatened. To ensure that the ethos of the good practice is continued there needs to be someone to continually push the work life balance of staff forward.
Case Study 5 – British Aerospace Modern Apprenticeship Programme

Airbus, the Broughton-based manufacturing giant turned to it’s North East Wales neighbour Deeside College to help build a new skilled workforce after winning the coveted contract to build the wings for the new A380 airliner. As a result of this highly successful partnership, Airbus was been named Employer of the Year in ELWa's Modern Apprenticeship Awards - Wales 2004 and was also the winner of a highly prized National Training Award.

Since the partnership between Airbus UK and Deeside College in North Wales began in 1993, sixteen females have gone though the Modern Apprenticeship scheme and in 2005 they had five female apprentices. It is Airbus’ opinion that training female apprentices is easy when they actually managed to get females recruited into the programme. The response from members of staff had been positive, as they also got involved in encouraging more females into the programmes.

When it comes to encouraging more women into the industry, the Apprentices Programme Leader said

“I encourage our female apprentices to get involved with as many activities as possible, for example, visiting open days at schools. The female apprentices often give a different perspective to things and sometimes challenge the way in which we do things which has improved the way we operate within the programmes.”

Although Airbus has found it difficult to recruit female apprentices their retention rate is 100%. Airbus said that the female apprentices are often very hard working and once they have gained some confidence they contribute very effectively often giving different perspective to many situations. In 2002 Maxine Cavanagh was Airbus’ Apprentice of the Year. She has won many events and Airbus is extremely proud of her achievements - she is considered an example to any young woman considering a future in engineering in Wales.
Case Study 6 – Cymru Kitchens Ltd.

Cymru Kitchens Ltd was a company that received assistance by the SME Equality Project. It is a kitchen, bedroom and bathroom design and fitting company. It is owned by Directors Paul Hogan and William Fox and is growing quickly. The business comprises a showroom, offices and warehouse in Newport and the external activities of design and fitting.

Cymru Kitchens Ltd first became involved with the SME Equality Project at the end of 2002.

The areas of development were:

- employment policies in place in line with equal opportunities best practice
- flexible working practices established for all staff both on and off site
- developing recruitment and selection practices and person specifications for all staff
- advice on Investment in People and it’s appropriateness for the company along with a plan to move ahead on quality control

At the time of Stage One there were 13 staff, 6 male, 7 female, all white. The fitters were a mixture of self and directly employed. Five of the staff were part-time. Staff worked very flexibly, by arrangement, to fit around home commitments although no formal policy existed.

The Second Stage development took place six months later. Since the Stage One development the general manager had left and the two directors, were taking direct responsibility for Human Resources. Two new staff had been taken on and recruitment had taken place in line with the new Recruitment and Selection Policy, the warehouse expansion led to further recruitment. Mr. Hogan, as a result of the Stage Two development, updated and agreed all the job descriptions and carried out a full appraisal process with all staff. This process raised issues about the equality and fairness of pay and review structures in the company and the directors wanted to address this. The SME Equality Project supported the company to carry out an Equal Pay Review.

The Equal Pay Review gave the company some very important information. Staff were not paid fairly or equally and some of the employment conditions were not organised fairly; bank holidays were not allotted on a pro rata basis.
for part time staff with some getting all of them and others none. The directors also had no idea whether the levels of pay were in line with equivalent jobs locally. In order to address these issues an internet and job centre search was carried out to provide some benchmark information. A pay scale was then developed with each job being given a starting and finishing point on the scale with attention to the principals of equality and fairness. This then enabled each member of staff to be placed on the scale and future progression to be based on target achievement and commitment. The company will agree a standard of living rise for all staff, each year, in line with inflation. All terms and conditions were reviewed to ensure that they were provided on an equal basis for all staff.

Mr Hogan and Mr Fox feel that their involvement with the SME Equality Project has been of immense benefit to themselves and to the company as a whole. The Equal Pay Review has meant that they have now a secure foundation on which to continue the positive staff development processes that they have put in place and can be secure in the knowledge that company pay and reward structures are fair and equal.

5.2 Positive Action

What is positive action?

Positive action is a generic term for programmes which take some kind of initiative to increase, maintain or rearrange the number or status of certain groups in society who are under-represented or face particular barriers. Positive action is permitted under the sex and race regulations in order to help overcome barriers or address imbalance in certain areas. Targeted to a particular group, activities are intended to eliminate and prevent discrimination or to offset disadvantages arising from existing attitudes, behaviours and structures.

Positive action should, on no account, be confused with positive discrimination. Positive discrimination (employing someone because of their gender, race, disability etc.) is unlawful – we cannot purposefully discriminate against any group in society whether they are in the minority or majority. However, it is possible to run training courses for women only or lone parents only, as this is a positive step towards them becoming employed. The only exception to this rule is when there is a Genuine Occupational Requirement. This means that some jobs will need to be done by someone of a particular gender, race etc. Examples of these jobs are seen in the nursing profession,
where individuals are expected to provide personal hygiene care; or in a women’s refuge; or in the acting profession. In some cases special dispensation can be give to some equality organisations to employ people who are disabled, of certain sexual orientation or religion, but only if the post requires these elements as essential to the nature of the work.

Why is positive action necessary?

In an ideal world we would need to take positive action because mainstreaming would deal with all the issues. However, it is sometimes necessary to undertake positive action as a prerequisite to mainstreaming. Taking positive action can often lead to facilitating mainstreaming as the first step in the process. Often, targeting particular groups in society is most effective when instant results are needed. Projects that are implemented as positive action often have measurable outcomes and firm foundations on which to build.

Negative aspects of positive action

One of the negative aspects of positive action is that it can only be a short-term approach. Sometimes it is necessary to repeat the process in order to achieve the desired result. Other times positive action is still not enough to facilitate mainstreaming. Positive action can only be truly successful when applied as a partnership approach, involving mainstream agents from the outset. This is not always possible.
Case study 7 - Women’s Enterprise Wales, Chwarae Teg

The Women’s Enterprise Wales and Lone Parent Venture project was established in 2000 to provide support, training and assistance to women at the pre-business start up stage of self-employment/business creation. The project closed in March 2006 having helped establish over 700 new businesses, creating more than 1,000 new jobs and provided assistance to about 2,500 women during the project period.

This initiative was developed by Chwarae Teg and the All Wales Enterprise Action Group for Women, a multi agency partnership, as a response to clear statistical information that the proportion of women starting and running businesses was significantly lower in Wales than across the United Kingdom as a whole.

Women’s Enterprise Wales provided clearly defined and focused pre-start-up support, training and assistance and operated across Wales from several locally based Enterprise Development Units.

There were three main components to the project:

- A comprehensive research programme conducted by the University of Wales Lampeter. This study provided the base-line data with the aim of providing all business advice and support agencies in Wales with Accurate, accessible, standardized gender disaggregated information on business start-ups, growth factors and survival rates.

  The research findings “Women Starting Businesses” and “Improving Women’s Access to Finance” carried out by ARAD Consulting are now available from [www.womensenterprisewales.org.uk](http://www.womensenterprisewales.org.uk)

- The second and most active part of the project – Positive Action Measures – provided an outreach service for women. The “Taste of Enterprise” or “Exploring Enterprise” workshops were tailored to meet women’s needs in the flexibility of the sessions and consideration given to family care with financial support available to cover costs. Participation in these workshops were supported by individual counseling sessions with Enterprise Development team to explore business ideas in more detail.

- The final part of the project which will continue with other partners, mainstreaming gender equality strategies with new and existing support systems, ensures that women friendly advice and guidance is available
from mainstream business support agencies and those concerned with provision of services to businesses.

Although the Women’s Enterprise Wales project has finished, there is still a demand for positive action measures to encourage more women to set up in business and contribute to the economy of Wales and the next challenges will be to ensure that these embryonic businesses are given the support to ensure long term sustainability and growth.

Case Study 8 - Ready SET Go!

The Ready, SET, Go project focused on increasing the integration of women into the workforce, targeting sectors where women were currently under-represented and where female retention was low.

Launched in 2004, the project was challenging gender segregation in the workforce on three fronts. It firstly provided the support and training for women wishing to access careers in atypical sectors of science, engineering, technology, construction and conservation offering guidance through a range of interventions including careers advice, training and short taster-courses.

The second strand of the project worked with employers from these sectors to encourage and support when recruiting and retaining women and to promote measures to balance work and home responsibilities. A short training programme for employers called “Open the Door to a More Diverse Workforce” emphasised the economic argument for work practices which promoted better balance, supported employers in implementing policies, procedures and ethics with gender integration and reduced job segregation – the business case for diversity.

The third aspect entailed working with teachers, educators, training providers and advisers from a range of referral agencies and gatekeepers who influenced career choices, to ensure that they were up to date with the opportunities available for women wishing to enter non-stereotypical careers.

This vertical segregation in career choices had ensured women were over represented in the lower paid sectors of the employment market. In summary, women were and still are under-employed, underpaid and selecting stereotypical career routes that continue and strengthen this cycle.

A range of short taster courses were delivered in collaboration with local training providers, colleges of Further Education and organisations such as The National Trust. Some of the courses included:
Each course had an element of personal development, skills audit and careers guidance. The most important aspect of any course is building the confidence of females whether in returning to learn with clear signposting and progression routes to future employment, education or training. The findings of the project are available on the Chwarae Teg website www.chwaraeteg.com in the near future.
Chapter 6

The European perspective

European Policy

At a European level of governance, parallel and complementary initiatives address the pay gap problem. As an official document explains:

“Article 141 of the Treaty of Amsterdam (previously Article 119 of the Treaty of Rome) requires Member States to ensure that the principle of equal pay for male and female workers for equal work or work of equal value is applied.”

The Equal Pay Directive explains the practical application of equal pay, namely the elimination of sex discrimination in pay systems. European law defines pay as:

“The ordinary basic or minimum wage or salary and any other consideration, whether in cash or kind, which the worker receives directly or indirectly, in respect of his employer or employment. Pensions are treated as pay.”

This European policy as well as the European Employment Strategy played an integral role in the emphasis placed on gender equality in the European Structural Funds Programmes for Wales between 2000-2006. Equal Opportunities became a cross-cutting theme throughout the whole programme. On a strategic level the programmes included specific targets for equal opportunities in the field of employment, training and childcare provision, whereas at an operational level all projects had to demonstrate an equality strategy as a criteria for receiving European funding. In addition there were specific funding programmes to enable the promotion of gender equality. The involvement of key equality agencies in the monitoring of these European funding programmes through the European Equality Partnership also allowed for far reaching impact on public policy and practice. The good practice developed within the European Funding Programmes in Wales was shared with other UK and European countries. It is hoped that a similar emphasis on equality will be evident in the new programmes for 2007-2013.

On the 1st of March 2006, the European Commission adopted a roadmap for equality between women and men for the period 2006-2010. It sets out a number of priorities to meet the challenges of globalisation, an ageing
population, a low birth rate and maintaining sustainable social protection systems. These priorities include the economic independence of women and men, reconciliation between work and private life, a balanced participation between women and men in political and economic decision-making and the elimination of stereotypes and the promotion of equality beyond the EU.

In parallel to this the Lisbon Agenda sets out a renewed European strategy for growth and jobs, in particular a 60% employment rate for women, as well as securing work life balance for both women and men.

The European Union are firmly setting the pace for gender mainstreaming - it’s now up to all participating countries to step up and deliver.

**Trans-national Partnership Working**

In order to ensure progress and establish a firm foundation for it’s work the Cytgord partnership formed close working relationship with other European partners, who were themselves working towards gender equality in their own regions. Some of the Cytgord partners already had close links with other countries, which benefited the project immensely, other partnerships were forged through the EQUAL European Social Fund. Countries who worked particularly closely with Cytgord were:

- Austria (Vorarlberg region)
- Spain (Cordoba region)
- Finland (Lapland)

All three countries were exploring ways of promoting gender equality in employment through research, training or other pro-active approaches. The experience of joint-working was enriching and rewarding and gave the opportunity to share good practice, explore new methods and to fly the flag for good progress already being made.

During Cytgord’s trans-national work many examples of good practice and innovation in gender equality were identified and are recorded in the following section. These include examples from the participating countries as well as those gathered during relevant conferences.
European good practice and innovation

France – incentive for families

Working mothers in France are being offered nearly £6,500 to take a year out to have a third baby.

The cash incentive is part of a radical government plan to stem the diminishing birth rate, particularly among middle-class professionals. France boasts one of the highest rate of female employment in the EU. But this has led to a dramatic fall in the numbers of babies born to better-educated working families. Under the scheme mothers or fathers who stop working to raise a third child will receive up to £535 a month for a year. It will however, be limited to one year to encourage women to return to work quickly. The grant is three times more than the monthly child benefit paid to British families with three children. The old scheme only really attracted those women in poorly paid work, not those with qualifications and competitive careers. The scheme may even encourage fathers to take a year off.

Shortening the time period but increasing the sum aims to help mothers get back into their jobs quicker after giving birth, and prevent them from suffering career disadvantages.

France already has a comprehensive array of incentives for childbearing, including generous child allowances and a calibrated income tax system that means that families with more children pay less. At present, 81 per cent of French women aged 25 to 49 are in work, including 75 per cent of those with two children and 51 per cent of those with more than two.

Science in the sun at Côte d’Azur

The Sophia Antipolis Project is an economic development model and was the first science park in Europe. Five local authorities came together to create an industrial park of 2,360 hectares, housing over 1,000 companies in the science and technology sectors. The park also includes a village for employees which includes 4 schools; a University; shops; 3 golf courses; 30 tennis courts and many crèches. In the year 2000 the park was 95% male dominated. However, since the introduction of an aggressive marketing campaign the park boasted a 60/40 female dominated gender split in 2006. It adopted a marketing campaign aimed at attracting female run businesses and female employees through widely used advertisements focused on diversity as the key driver for innovation.
Finland – childcare support

There is a strong childcare framework in Finland, with women having a prominent place in the workforce. In Finland there is a financial homecare allowance which was introduced in 2001. This is available to all parents of children under 3 years old. Men or women can be paid to stay at home to care for the child, or alternatively this can be transferred to a grandparent. There is also municipal day care provision, where day-care centres are open 24 hours a day, seven days a week.

Childcare allowances and day-care provision is subsidised by the government in, which means that taxes are quite high. However, men and women who work are willing to pay these taxes as they make a difference to their working lives and to that of their children.

Women who have taken time off to care for children in Finland can return to their former position of employment up to 3 years after the child is born.

Spain – teaching the teachers

In Spain some regions deliver intensive training programmes for potential teachers and those already teaching, in how to break down gender stereotypes. Training is provided by a range of specialist organisations and funded by the government and the European Social Fund. The NEMESIS project aims to tackle stereotypes and provide a comprehensive training programme for educators across the Cordoba region of Spain.

Courses are held centrally as part of the teacher-training programme for potential teachers - but only in parts of Spain as a pilot project. Qualified teachers are also expected to attend training sessions that forms part of their ongoing training programme. In parallel, school children are also involved in awareness-raising sessions through interactive media, play and classroom activities. These sessions aim to eliminate stereotyping at an early age and to promote gender equality in education and career choice. Parents are involved in some activities to ensure that key messages are continued in the home. Early indications show that this approach is proving very successful and could be rolled out to the rest of the country over the coming years.
**Austria – balancing work and life on a technology park**

*Millennium Park* in Vorarlberg is a newly built technology park that implements work life balance practices for its employees. The park prides itself on the recruitment of women and older people as being integral to the innovation of the area.

The park has a large day-care facility for children from 6 months to 6 years and is based on the pedagogy concept of care, which includes education and play. The park also run ‘intergenerational lunches’, where people of all ages can meet each other and discuss common issues relating to work or home life once a month in a comfortable environment. Currently 70% of the workforce attend and enjoy these lunches regularly.

The park also organises music concerts for children and adults to come together and enjoy a social event at a nearby location. This also encourages adults to spend some time with children when they finish work or before they return to work.

An emphasis is also placed on the health and well-being of employees and its importance as part of a healthy work life balance. Sports clubs are encouraged, and two ‘health weeks’ proved successful with the focus on mobility and nutrition.

**Italy – the Modena model**

In Italy local authorities have been experimenting with radical approaches to gender mainstreaming. Modena municipal authority in the Emilia-Romagna region developed ‘urban times’ policies at the beginning of the 1990’s in response to the need for innovation and change in the relationship between citizens and public services. The city was seen as a place of communication and exchange, as a focus for renewed involvement of citizens in political and social life. Gendered assumptions about people’s lives were challenged in a highly innovative way in order to meet the needs of women in the city.

Research demonstrated that while female economic activity rates had increased, men’s contribution to home and family had not. This was putting serious time constraints on women. Modena has become a model city in terms of its new uses of time to suit the reality of women’s lives. It has sought to harmonise the opening times of shops and public services and the timing of transport, schools and working hours to accommodate women. ‘Urban times’ policies based on the Modena model seem to be spreading to other parts of Italy.
Ireland – gender and agriculture

The National Development Plan Gender Equality Unit of Ireland worked with the University of Strathclyde in Glasgow to develop guidance on how to mainstream gender equality into rural development and agriculture.

Facts sheets and guidance documents were produced to complement the National Development Plan on the main issues facing women in rural development, and good practice examples were issued on how to mainstream, in what could be perceived as a difficult area.

Together with Chwarae Teg in 2001 a comprehensive gender equality training programme for personnel and managers of the agriculture and rural development departments was developed and delivered. This has since remained an example of good practice across other departments in the Irish government, and is included on the UK Irish Network website as an exemplar model.
Chapter 7

Summary of Key Issues

This book has highlighted and examined the issues surrounding the gender pay gap in Wales. Even after 30 years of sex equality legislation not only is the pay gap prevalent, but examples of discrimination and unjust action can be seen in many areas of the labour market. It is time for joint pro-active action by all key stakeholders, and for a modernisation of equality law.

Of course we also have take into account that some women and lone parents will choose certain occupations and hours of work in order to suit their situation and work requirements at the time. This deserves support. Some parents or carers may also choose to remain economically inactive. The issue, however, is that all women and lone parents should be afforded the opportunities and choice to enable them to pursue education, training and employment should they so wish, and do so on an equal footing with men.

Paying women less than men for doing the same work is unjust and unlawful. These are sufficient reasons in themselves to see the gender pay gap eliminated. The continuing undervaluing of women’s work should not be a feature of a modern and competitive economy. The Welsh economy needs to be equipped for equality, if Wales is to compete effectively in the UK and world market. We need to value and reward contribution of all our people.

We have seen examples of pro-active approaches, positive action and models of good practice that demonstrate that employers, training and educations providers, policy makers and others are actively working towards closing the gap. However, we have also seen that the majority of these projects depended on European funding or Welsh Assembly Government funding. With changes in European funding to be introduced in 2007 there is a danger that these projects will not continue or that similar projects will not be funded. Further resources are needed to enable good practice to continue providing a firm foundation for successful equality mainstreaming in Wales.

The Cytgord Development Partnership believes that the recommendations in this book are aspirational and realistic. Their successful implementation requires commitment, resources and joint action to close the gender pay gap in Wales.
Chapter 8

Summary of Recommendations for policy and practice

Recommendations at national level:

- Addressing the gender pay gap in Wales needs to be a matter of priority for unions, employers and the National Assembly for Wales.

- There is a need for mandatory pay reviews for all employers in Wales.

- The National Assembly for Wales needs to continue funding campaigns like Close the Pay Gap and other initiatives in Wales if the gap is to close in the next few years.

- Occupational segregation needs to be tackled as one of the main reasons for the gender pay gap. More pro-active approaches need to be taken to facilitate mainstreaming.

- Gender stereotyping needs to be tackled at the earliest possible age. Working with children in primary schools and their parents is essential to break down barriers and promote equality in the labour market.

- The National Assembly for Wales need to consider developing a programme of equality representatives in the workplace similar to the Health and Safety representatives and shop stewards. This would have a far-reaching impact across Wales.

- It is essential to review and update the current gender equality legislation and to apply mandatory measures in order to make significant progress to close the pay gap.

- There is potential with the new Commission for Equality and Human Rights to harness the pay gap with renewed vigour and promote campaigns with a unified voice.

- Public sector procurement needs to be managed more effectively so that businesses wanting to provide services to the public sector are forced to
address equality. This should be done through criteria attached as an essential part of assessment.

- The Cytgord partnership needs to continue following the end of the project to ensure a collaborative approach to addressing the gender pay gap in Wales.

- The Cytgord partnership see Chwarae Teg as having an integral role in closing the gender pay gap once the Equal Opportunities Commission ceases to exist as they will be the only national gender equality body in Wales.

- The Gender Public Duty will see a move in the right direction to ensure gender equality within large public sector organisations in Wales, however much remains to be done to support SME’s in Wales, who make up the majority of employers.

- Paternity rights need to be on a par with maternity rights if we are to progress gender equality in the workplace.

- Equal pay is a complicated issue. Adequate resources to provide information and support is imperative if employers are to tackle this effectively.

- Gender budgeting needs to be developed as a key tool for achieving gender mainstreaming and in demonstrating compliance with the new gender equality duty.

- Without adequate financial investment in the Work Life Balance agenda, cultures and practices will not change soon enough. A national campaign is needed to raise awareness of the benefits of Work Life Balance for all.

- There is a need to bring women’s views and perspectives even further into public life and the policy making and delivery mechanisms: not as an adjustment but at the heart of every social and economic policy ensuring that women of all groups are properly represented.

- A pilot programme with SME’s in Wales is recommended to develop good practice with regard to gender equality in the workplace.
• A pilot programme with public sector organisations needs to be developed focused on good practice with regard to promoting the Gender Public Duty in 2007.

• All political parties in Wales need to be encouraged to take positive action to improve women’s representation in Parliament.

Recommendations at UK level:

• The Department of Work and Pensions to develop its New Deal initiatives aimed at women returners and lone parents to ensure that work experience and training is suitable to their needs and to review the pay structure of the scheme.

• The new Gender Public Duty should specifically ensure that action is taken on all causes of the gender pay gap including occupational segregation, the impact of caring responsibilities and unequal pay. Specified action should include as regular equal pay review and action plan.

• The new Commission for Equality and Human Rights should develop practical advice and guidance which actively encourages good practice and diversity in employment, education and training and policy development.

• The new CEHR needs to include age if the age discrimination legislation is to have any real impact. There is a need for the new body to enjoy the further power that the Commission for Racial Equality enjoys under the 1999 Race (Amendment) Act. This requires all public bodies to positively promote equality, rather than just pursue the more negative search for discrimination.
Transnational delegates from Austria, Spain and Finland, partners of the CYTGORD project, meet in Cardiff in October 2005 for the first transnational visit.